## A FUZZY METHODOLOGY FOR LOCAL ENTREPRENEURIAL CULTURE EVALUATION: EVIDENCE FROM POST-SOVIET KYRGYZSTAN

## A. Göleç<sup>1,2\*</sup> & A. Maksudunov<sup>3</sup>

### ARTICLE INFO

#### Article details

1 Dec 2017
18 Apr 2019
29 May 2019

Contact details \* Corresponding author ademgolec@erciyes.edu.tr

#### Author affiliations

- 1 Department of Management, Faculty of Economics and Administrative Sciences, Kyrgyz-Turkish Manas University, Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan
- 2 Department of Industrial Engineering, Faculty of Engineering, Erciyes University, Kayseri, Turkey
- 3 Department of Management, Faculty of Economics and Administrative Sciences, Kyrgyz-Turkish Manas University, Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan

DOI

http://dx.doi.org/10.7166/30-1-1883

## ABSTRACT

This paper assesses the local entrepreneurial culture based on the perceptions of local residents, by focusing on four distinct dimensions of the local entrepreneurial culture: 'diversity and climate', change 'business promotion climate', 'business discouragement climate', and 'focus on local'. A comprehensive survey was used to assess the local entrepreneurial culture in Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan. The items included in the survey were categorised as positive or negative statements that describe the respondent's county. This paper provides a framework that consists of a two-level model to construct a quantitative measure of local entrepreneurial culture. Essentially, a fuzzy artificial decision is based on data collected by conducting the survey with entrepreneurs and non-entrepreneurs. At the top level, a fuzzy multicriteria decision-making model was used to measure the local entrepreneurial culture. This model assesses the entrepreneurial culture in the community development practices of managers, contributes to future entrepreneurial research, identifies practices for entrepreneurial culture, and assesses the role of local cultural characteristics in entrepreneurship. This study includes a novel methodology, compared with those described in the literature, as it includes a conceptual model based on the perceptions of local residents. The results of this study showed that Bishkek's entrepreneurial culture is below the middle level.

#### OPSOMMING

'n Omvattende meningspeiling is gebruik die plaaslike entrepreneurskultuur in Bisjkek, Kirgisië te beoordeel. Dit word op grond van die persepsies van die plaaslike inwoners beoordeel deur vier dimensies van die plaaslike entrepreneurskultuur te ondersoek, naamlik diversiteit veranderingsklimaat, besigheiden bevorderingsklimaat, besigheid-ontmoedigingsklimaat en die fokus op plaaslike belange. Die items in die meningspeiling is gekategoriseer as positiewe of negatiewe stellings wat die respondent se distrik beskryf. Hierdie artikel verskaf 'n raamwerk wat uit 'n tweevlakkige model bestaan en gebruik kan word as 'n kwantitatiewe maatstaf van plaaslike entrepreneurskultuur. 'n Wasige, kunsmatige besluit is gegrond op die meningspeiling terugvoer. Op die boonste van die twee vlakke is 'n wasige, multi besluitnemingsmodel kriteria gebruik om die plaaslike entrepreneurskapkultuur te meet. Die model assesseer die entrepreneurskultuur in die gemeenskapontwikkelingspraktyke van bestuurders, dit dra by tot toekomstige entrepreneurskapverwante navorsing en assesseer die rol van plaaslike kulturele eienskappe in entrepreneurskap. Hierdie studie sluit 'n nuwe metodologie in, teenoor dit wat in die literatuur beskryf is, omdat dit 'n konseptuele model gegrond op die plaaslike gemeenskap se persepsies insluit. Die resultate toon dat Bisjkek se entrepreneurskapkultuur ondergemiddeld is.

## 1 INTRODUCTION

Entrepreneurship is an important phenomenon in the market economy. It is also perceived as a main determinant of economic growth and social change. Entrepreneurial activities play a major role in both developed and developing countries. Several studies have revealed that the development of an entrepreneurial culture may differ, depending on the socio-cultural and economic environment of a country ([1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7]).

Over the last few years, promoting entrepreneurial activities and stimulating the emergence of entrepreneurs have been relevant issues for most countries. The development of entrepreneurship first requires the measurement and assessment of the entrepreneurial culture of the society in a country. 'Entrepreneurial culture' is conceptualised as a society that depicts the exhibits entrepreneurial attributes, values, mindsets, and behaviour [8]. In other words, an entrepreneurial culture is linked to the values shared by entrepreneurs, such as risk-taking, innovativeness, and proactiveness.

In countries where a centrally planned economic system has dominated for a long time, entrepreneurship activities cannot be expected to be common. Kyrgyzstan, which is a post-Soviet Union country that gained its independence in 1991, is no exception. However, after gaining independence, the spirit of entrepreneurship in Kyrgyzstan began to evolve and spread throughout the country. Transitioning from a planned economy to a market economy gives rise to particular difficulties, especially in the creation of an entrepreneurial culture. This is because, for a long time, all social and economic activities were controlled by the state, and citizens would have no incentive to take entrepreneurial risks.

Since gaining independence, several reforms to the market economy have been implemented in Kyrgyzstan, which have led to small and medium-sized enterprises emerging due to a change in mindset. According to the National Statistical Committee of the Kyrgyz Republic, 14,000 small and medium-sized enterprises currently operate in the country and have provided employment opportunities for about 88,300 people [9]. This drastic change has been recognised internationally and, according to the World Bank's Doing Business Report of 2016, the Kyrgyz Republic ranked 64<sup>th</sup> among 189 countries [10].

With the implementation of several reforms in the 25 years since gaining independence, there have been notable changes in the entrepreneurial culture of Kyrgyz citizens. However, limited empirical research has been done on the dimensions of this change related to entrepreneurial culture, and this study aims to fill this gap.

This paper begins with a review of the evaluation of entrepreneurial culture. Then the research methodology based on the specific research statements developed by Breazeale *et al.* [11] is presented. A two-level evaluation model was used to construct a quantitative measure of the local entrepreneurial culture. At the basic level, a fuzzy artificial decision was obtained, based on data collected by conducting the survey with entrepreneurs and non-entrepreneurs. At the top level, a fuzzy multicriteria decision-making model was used to measure the local entrepreneurial culture. The paper concludes by discussing the value and importance of this measurement for community development practices.

## 2 LITERATURE REVIEW

The issue of evaluating entrepreneurial culture has become of great interest in academic studies ([4] [12] [13] [8] [11]) and research reports published by international institutions ([14] [15] [16]). While some of these publications are based on the opinion of individuals, others are based at the organisational level. In other words, entrepreneurial culture and entrepreneurial activities are evaluated according to the opinions of non-entrepreneurial individuals, entrepreneurs, and experts alike.

Until the 1990s, a limited number of studies had been conducted on evaluating entrepreneurial activities and the indicators for comparative evaluation [17]. Subsequent studies have been carried out, with one of the most relevant being the global report of the Global Entrepreneurship Monitor

(GEM). Initiated in 1999, this report covers the results from 62 economies completing the Adult Population Survey (APS) and 62 economies completing the National Expert Survey (NES). According to the report, 68 per cent of working-age adults, on average, perceive entrepreneurs in their societies as having a high status, and 42 per cent see good opportunities around them for starting a business [14]. Sweden was the highest-ranking country globally on this indicator (70.2%). Kyrgyzstan has not yet been included in this ranking. Among the Central Asian countries, only Kazakhstan was included in this ranking, and its score in 2018 was 48.7 per cent for opportunity perceptions [18].

Another global study in this field is the Global Entrepreneurship Index (GEINDEX), developed by the Global Entrepreneurship and Development Institute. This index evaluates the entrepreneurial attitudes, abilities, and aspirations of 140 countries using a 14-dimensional scale. Kyrgyzstan ranked 92<sup>nd</sup> among 137 countries in the GEINDEX ranking, with a rate of 21 per cent. Kyrgyzstan was also on the highest level on the human capital indicator and on the lowest level for risk-taking. Among the Central Asian countries, Kazakhstan came in 17<sup>th</sup> with a rate of 30 per cent, and Tajikistan occupied the 95<sup>th</sup> position with a rate of 20.7 per cent. The USA was the highest-ranking country (89.4%) in the GEINDEX ranking [19].

The World Bank is one of the authorities that evaluates entrepreneurial activities. According to the World Bank Group Entrepreneurship Survey (WBGES), Kyrgyzstan came in 89<sup>th</sup> with a rate of 1.08 among 138 countries. This report is based only on limited liability companies. Data is provided on new business entry density, defined as the number of newly registered corporations per 1 000 working-age people [20].

The research of international institutions is important in evaluating entrepreneurial activities at national levels, and for international comparisons. However, such studies are criticised in the academic literature, as the conceptual foundations of most indices used in these studies are insufficiently developed [17]. Moreover, these indices mostly focus on national levels, overlooking the role of local cultural characteristics. Consequently, evaluating entrepreneurial culture at a local level is crucial for research [11]. As with many topics in this field, scholars have addressed this question in their studies. While some of these studies propose to adapt a scale for measuring entrepreneurial culture ([12] [11]), others aim to find the relationship between entrepreneurial activities and entrepreneurial culture ([1] [4] [13]). Table 1 summarises these other studies.

Recent literature has emphasised the significant relationship between culture and entrepreneurship. In these studies, entrepreneurial culture is considered to be of great importance for economic development. The evaluation of entrepreneurial culture is crucial for the implementation of plans, programmes, and strategies. The entrepreneurial activity of the Kyrgyz Republic is evaluated by some indices of international institutions. However, a limited number of studies are devoted to measuring local entrepreneurial culture. Entrepreneurial culture could play a major role in the economic success of Kyrgyzstan. Consequently, the evaluation of entrepreneurial culture is crucial to the promotion, policies, and practices of entrepreneurship.

In most of these studies, the data are collected by questionnaires or surveys that assess many domains on issues related to psychology, such as perceptions, opinions, emotional states, etc. The questionnaires have responses that are usually distributed using Likert scales, and require respondents to select one from a list of predetermined labels. However, fuzzy questionnaires have a structure that combines visual analogue and fuzzy linguistic scales when analysing responses. Fuzzy methods treat each data point individually, and therefore relevant information is not lost.

In the fuzzy studies, the problems encountered have been solved by fuzzy methods, which the researchers believe to be more effective than crisp studies. The strength of these fuzzy methods is described in detail by Haris and Rahman [22]. In this study, a fuzzy artificial decision is first obtained, based on data collected by the survey, and then a fuzzy multicriteria decision is employed to evaluate the local entrepreneurial culture.

The nature and development of countries in transition     Interviews and statistics     It emphasises that historical, socio-cultural, and countries in transition       [3]     entrepreneurship in transition     Survey and analytical research     It estigates that the highest level of entrepreneurial activity does not show the highest level of entrepreneurial orientation       [4]     Max empirical comparative research analytical research     The results of the study present particular analytical research       [7]     study amog entrepreneurs from Romania and Moldova entrepreneurial culture     Survey and analytical research     The results of the study present particular similar times and differences between both factor in the development of entrepreneurial culture       [11]     deasuring the international entrepreneurial culture     Survey and analytical research     It evaluates an entrepreneurial culture at a local entrepreneurial culture       [12]     Measuring the international entrepreneurial culture     Survey and analytical research     It evaluates an entrepreneurial culture at a local entrepreneurial culture       [13]     Investigating the family entrepreneurial culture     Survey and analytical research     It evaluates in peopherunity-based operationalists the inportance of promoting entrepreneurial induction in the develops foresign by considering both the community and business appects as part of a coherent whole       [14]     Investigating entrepreneurial culture interpreneurial induction interpreneurial cu	Article	Nature of problem	Method	Advantage of method used
[3]     entrepreneurship in Central Asian     Statistics     economic contexts appear to be important       [4]     identifying differences among the USA, Korea, Fiji, India, and Malaysia     Survey and analytical research     It suggests that the highest level of entrepreneursia activity does not show the highest level of entrepreneursing activity does not show the institute and differences between both countres       [7]     An empirical comparative research analytical research     The relationship between analytical research     The relationship between entrepreneursia activity does not show the institute an entrepreneursia culture       [8]     Entrepreneursing avainative research entrepreneursia culture     Survey and analytical research     It emphasises that the entrepreneursia culture     It emphasises that the entrepreneursia culture       [10]     It explanations and moldowa     Survey and analytical research     It explanations and on themational entrepreneursia listical research       [11]     Investigating the family entrepreneursia listical repreneursing interpreneursia     Survey and analytical research     It emphasises the importance of promoting entrepreneursia listical research       [12]     Investigating the family entrepreneursia listical research     It emphasises the importance of promoting entrepreneursia listical research       [13]     Investigating entrepreneursia foresight     Survey and analytical research     It enemphasises the importance of pro		The nature and development of	Interviews and	It emphasises that historical, socio-cultural, and
countries in transition     factors that affect the busines environment.       [4]     Investigating the role of culture by identifying differences among the USA, Korea, Fiji, India, and Malayia     Excesses that the highest level of enterpreneurial orientation       [7]     study amog enterpreneurs from analytical research in the enterpreneurial orientation     The results of the study present particular study present particular is and differences between both enterpreneurial particles and differences between both enterpreneurial culture       [8]     enterpreneurial culture     Survey and analytical research in the enterpreneurial culture at a local culture enterpreneurial culture analytical research     It emphases that the enterpreneurial culture at a local analytical research enterpreneurial culture at a local enterpreneurial culture in the research enterpreneurial culture integration of international enterpreneurial culture integration of international enterpreneurial culture integration in the model operationalistic she differences by considering both the conservent whole integration international enterpreneurial intent, and futures integration intermational enterpreneurial intent, and futures integration interpreneurial culture integration interpreneurial culture integration interpreneurial substitute analytical analytical interpreneurial culture integration interpreneurial culture integration interpreneurial culture integration enterpreneurial culture integration interpreneurial integration interpreneurial integration interpreneurial integration interesearch contenterpreneurial integration interpreneurial integra	[3]	entrepreneurship in Central Asian	statistics	economic contexts appear to be important
Investigating the role of culture by (d) identifying differences among the USA, Korea, Fiji, India, and Malaysia     Survey and analytical research     It suggests that the highest level of entrepreneurial activity does not show the highest level of entrepreneurination       [7]     An empirical comparative research analytical research     The results of the study present particular similarities and differences between both countres       [8]     The relationship between entrepreneurial activities     Survey and analytical research     It emphasises that the entrepreneurial culture       [11]     Measuring the incernational entrepreneurial culture     Survey and analytical research     It evaluates an entrepreneurial culture     It evaluates an entrepreneurial culture at a local investigating the family entrepreneurial intent, and futures foresight       [12]     Investigating the family entrepreneurial intent, and futures foresight     Survey and analytical research     It evaluates an entrepreneurial situits on the coherent whole       [13]     The importance of education in the second of entrepreneurial culture     Survey and analytical research     It emphasises the importance of promoting entrepreneurial skills and interest of students are enhanced at the end of the programmes       [14]     Detecting the family entrepreneurial culture of singatorn foresight     It evaluates an entrepreneurial skills and interest of students are enhanced at the end of the programmes       [16]     The special programme's impact on instruct		countries in transition		factors that affect the business environment
[4]     identifying differences among the USA, Kores, Fiji, India, and Malaysia An empirical comparative research Romania and Moldova     analytical research     entrepreneurial activity does not show the highest level of entrepreneurial orientation       [7]     study among entrepreneurs from Romania and Moldova     Survey and analytical research     the study present particular similarities and differences between both entrepreneurship baveness and entrepreneurship awareness and entrepreneurship awareness and entrepreneurship awareness and entrepreneurship awareness and analytical research     It emphasises that the entrepreneurship awareness promotion programmes were a crucial factor in the development of entrepreneurship entrepreneurship culture       [11]     Measuring the local entrepreneurial culture     Survey and analytical research     It evaluates an entrepreneurial culture at a local tevel       [12]     entrepreneurship culture, entrepreneurship culture, entrepreneurship culture, foresight     Survey and analytical research     It evaluates an entrepreneurship culture       [13]     entrepreneurship culture, entrepreneurship culture, foresight     Survey and analytical research     It emphasies the importance of promoting entrepreneurship comoting entrepreneurship comotin		Investigating the role of culture by	Survey and	It suggests that the highest level of
USA, Korea, Fiji, India, and Malaysia     research     highest level of entrepreneurilarities and differences between both       [7]     study among entrepreneurs from research     Survey and analytical research     The relationship between entrepreneurila culture       [8]     entrepreneurship avareness and entrepreneurial culture     It emphasises that the entrepreneurship avareness and entrepreneurship avareness and entrepreneurship avareness and entrepreneurship avareness and entrepreneurship culture.       [11]     deasuring the local entrepreneurial culture     Survey and analytical research     It evaluates an entrepreneurship optimity-based operationalisation of international entrepreneurship culture.       [12]     investigating the family     Analytical research     It evaluates an entrepreneurship both the cohereneurship culture.       [13]     entrepreneurship culture, entrepreneurship culture, entrepreneurship culture.     Survey and analytical research     It emphasises the importance of promoting entrepreneurship culture.       [14]     The importance of education in the disponet of entrepreneurship culture.     Survey and analytical research     It emphasises the importance of promoting entrepreneurship both the coheres of submets appect and analytical entrepreneurship culture in singapore faces appect and analytical entrepreneurship culture in Singapore faces appect and analytical entrepreneurship domains.       [21]     Entrepreneurship cohanis.     Analytical entrepreneurship cohanis.	[4]	identifying differences among the	analytical	entrepreneurial activity does not show the
An empirical comparative research Romania and Moldova     Survey and analytical     The results of the study present particular analytical       [8]     The results of the study present particular entrepreneurial culture     Survey and analytical     The results of the study present particular awareness promotion programmes were a crucial culture       [11]     Measuring the local entrepreneurial culture     Survey and analytical     The results of the study present particular awareness promotion programmes were a crucial culture       [12]     entrepreneurial culture     Survey and analytical     It proposes a comprehensive opportunity-based analytical       [13]     Investigating the family entrepreneurial culture     Feasarch     It proposes a comprehensive opportunity-based analytical       [14]     Herestigating the family entrepreneurial culture     Feasarch     It devolution for alget by considering both the coherent whole       [16]     Hevelopment of entrepreneurial culture analytical     It emphasises the importance of promoting execution       [17]     The special programme's impact on increasing entrepreneurial culture analytical     It emphasises the importance of promoting entrepreneurial culture in singapore       [18]     development of entrepreneurial culture and students     Survey and analytical     It emphasises the importance of promoting entrepreneurial culture in singapore       [20]		USA, Korea, Fiji, India, and Malaysia	research	highest level of entrepreneurial orientation
[7]     study among entrepreneurs from Romain and Moldova     similarities and differences between both research       [8]     The relationship between entrepreneurship avareness and entrepreneurship avareness and entrepreneurship avareness and entrepreneurship avareness and entrepreneurship avareness and culture     It emphasises that the entrepreneurship factor in the development of entrepreneurship analytical       [11]     Measuring the international entrepreneurship avareness and entrepreneurship culture     It evaluates an entrepreneurship analytical       [12]     Investigating the international entrepreneurship culture, entrepreneurship culture     Survey and analytical     It develops foresight by considers aspects as part of a coherent whole       [18]     development of entrepreneurship analytical     Survey and analytical     It emphasises the importance of promoting entrepreneurship davaticity in the scondary education level       [20]     bettering antrepreneurship culture among students     Survey and analytical     It entrepreneurship davaticity and interests of students are enhanced at the end of research       [21]     Detecting aversatile criterion set for methodology     In entrepreneurship davaticity and interests and entrepreneurship davaticity entrepreneurship davaticity and interests and ent		An empirical comparative research	Survey and	The results of the study present particular
Romania and Moldova     research     Countries       The relationship between entrepreneurial culture     Survey and analytical research     emphasises that the entrepreneurial culture       [11]     Measuring the local entrepreneurial culture     Survey and analytical research     It proposes a comprehensive opportunity-based level       [12]     entrepreneurial culture entrepreneurial culture, entrepreneurial culture, entrepreneurial culture, entrepreneurial culture, entrepreneurial culture     It proposes a comprehensive opportunity-based analytical entrepreneurial intern, and future foresight     It proposes a comprehensive opportunity-based entrepreneurial intern, and future foresight by considering both the community and business aspects as part of a coherent whole       [18]     Investigating entrepreneurial intern, and future foresight     Survey and analytical research     It emphasises the importance of promoting entrepreneurial values in people with secondary culture       [19]     Interesting entrepreneurial culture among students     Survey and analytical research     It discovers that the entrepreneurial sullis and investigating entrepreneurial culture analytical interest of students are enhanced at the end of the programme       [20]     Entrepreneurial culture interpreneurial culture interestof studente entrepreneurial culture interpreneurial c	[7]	study among entrepreneurs from	analytical	similarities and differences between both
The relationship between entrepreneurship avareness and entrepreneurship avareness and entrepreneurship avareness and culture     It emphasises that the entrepreneurship factor in the development of entrepreneurial culture       Measuring the local entrepreneurial culture     Measuring the international entrepreneurial culture     It evaluates an entrepreneurial culture analytical research     It evaluates an entrepreneurial culture analytical evel       Investigating the family entrepreneurship culture, entrepreneurship culture, analytical increasing entrepreneurship culture analytical entrepreneurship domains     It emphasises the importance of promoting education level       [18]     development of entrepreneurship analytical using participative observation methodology     It emphasises the importance of promoting entrepreneurship domains       [20]     by using participative observation methodology     It entrepreneurship domains       [21]     Entrepreneurship domains     Evel observation methodology     It enterpreneurship domains       [22]     Detecting the fuzzy MPP evaluating entrepreneurship domains     It enterpreneurship domains       [23]     An evaluation model for an methodology     <		Romania and Moldova	research	countries
[8]     entrepreneurial culture     awareness promotion programmes were a crucial research     awareness promotion programmes were a crucial culture       [11]     Measuring the local entrepreneurial culture     Survey and analytical research     It evaluates an entrepreneurial culture at a local level       [12]     Measuring the international entrepreneurial culture     Survey and analytical research     It proposes a comprehensive opportunity-based on international entrepreneuriship culture, research       [13]     entrepreneurial culture     Analytical research     It evelops foreight by considering both the community and business aspects as part of a culture       [14]     entrepreneurial intert, and futures     Community and business aspects as part of a culture research       [16]     The special programme's inpact on interging entrepreneurial volture analytical interests of students are enhanced at the end of the programme       [17]     Entrepreneurial culture     Participative observation methodology       [17]     Entrepreneurial culture in Singapore entrepreneurial culture of treas of entrepreneurial culture of promoting the research entrepreneurial culture of treas and entrepreneurial culture of treas of entrepreneurial promoting the research entrepreneurial culture of treas of entrepreneurial culture of treas of entrepreneurial set of analytical interest of students are enhanced at the end of treases the influence of promoting the research entrepreneurial culture of treas is significant methodology       [21]<		The relationship between	Survey and	It emphasises that the entrepreneurship
[10] entrepreneurial culture research factor in the development of entrepreneurial culture analytical research   [11] culture Survey and analytical research It evaluates an entrepreneurial culture at a local level   [12] Measuring the international entrepreneurial culture Survey and analytical research It proposes a comprehensive opportunity-based operationalisation of international entrepreneurisip culture, entrepreneurisip culture, entrepreneurisip culture, entrepreneurial culture foreight   [13] Investigating the family cultures foreight Analytical research It emphasises the importance of promoting entrepreneurial culture of entrepreneurial values in people with secondary education level culture on the special programme's impact on analytical research entrepreneurial values in people with secondary education level interests of students are enhanced at the end of the programme   [20] by using participative observation methodology It erwplasses the importance of area culture on the entrepreneurial culture on the enterprise creation process is significant methodology   [21] Entrepreneurial culture in Singapore Analytical research It erwplasses the importance of promoting the research entrepreneurial culture of total students and systematic decision-support tool   [22] Detecting the personality traits and entrepreneurial culture in Singapore Fuzzy AHP It acquires meaningful knowledge in various areas of entrepreneurial methodology   [23] An evaluation model for an motional institutions and uninversities to create new business apperts as a accurate,	191	entrepreneurship awareness and	analytical	awareness promotion programmes were a crucial
Measuring the local entrepreneurial culture     Survey and analytical research     culture       [11]     Measuring the international entrepreneurial culture     Survey and analytical research     It evaluates an entrepreneurial culture at alocal level       [12]     Measuring the international entrepreneurial culture     Survey and analytical research     It proposes a comprehensive opportunity-based operationalisation of international entrepreneurial development of entrepreneurial increasing entrepreneurial increasing entrepreneurial culture     Analytical research     It develops frossight by considering both the community and business aspects as part of a coherent whole       [19]     The importance of education in the among students     Survey and analytical research     It evelops frossight by considering both entrepreneurial skills and increasing entrepreneurial culture       [20]     Dy using participative observation methodology     Survey and analytical research     It discovers that the enterprete- recation process is significant methodology       [21]     Detecting the fuzzy methods used in entrepreneurial culture in Singapore     Analytical Analytical     It equicutes maningful knowledge in various areas of entrepreneurial culture of oritizens       [22]     Detecting the personality traits and entrepreneurial environment fuzzy AHP     The results and accurate, effective, and systematic decision-support tool       [24]     An evaluatin mediel of factors that influence the intentions of ind	[0]	entrepreneurial culture	research	factor in the development of entrepreneurial
Measuring the local entrepreneurial culture     Survey and analytical entrepreneurial culture     It evaluates an entrepreneurial culture at a local level       [12]     Measuring the international entrepreneurial culture     Survey and analytical research     It proposes a comprehensive opportunity-based operationalisation of international entrepreneurial post foresight       [13]     Investigating the family entrepreneurial untent, and futures foresight     Analytical research     It develops foresight by considering both the community and business aspects as part of a coherent whole       [13]     Investigating entrepreneurial culture     Survey and analytical research     It emphasises the importance of promoting entrepreneurial values in people with secondary ductation evel anong students       [19]     Increasing entrepreneurial culture among students     Survey and analytical research     It emphasises the importance of promoting entrepreneurial values in people with secondary ductation evel anong students       [20]     Entrepreneurial culture in Singapore valuating entrepreneurial outlure in Singapore evaluating entrepreneurial outlure in singapore evaluating entrepreneurial phasises the importance of promoting the entrepreneurial phasises the interpreneurial phasises the entrepreneurial minetrion set for evaluating entrepreneurial intention     It explaysises and fuzzy AIP       [24]     An evaluation model for an entrepreneurial intention model     Fuzzy AIP     The model suggests that enterpreneurial intention is related to a composite of various demographic				culture
[11]     culture     analytical research     level       [12]     Measuring the international entrepreneurial culture     Survey and analytical research     It proposes a comprehensive opportunity-based operationalisation of international entrepreneurship       [13]     Investigating the family entrepreneurship culture, foresight     Analytical trevereneurship culture, entrepreneurship culture, foresight     It evelops foresight by considering both the community and business aspects as part of a coherent whole       [19]     Interpreneurship culture research     It develops foreneurship entrepreneurship culture     Survey and analytical research     It emphasises the importance of promoting entrepreneural skills and interests of students are enhanced at the end of research       [19]     Increasing entrepreneurial culture by using participative observation methodology     Survey and analytical research     It eveals that the influence of Arab culture on the programme       [21]     Detecting the fuzzy methods used in entrepreneurship domains     The search     It equips meaningful knowledge in various areas of entrepreneurship domains       [22]     Detecting a versalite criterion set for entrepreneurship domains     Fiuzzy XHP     The results can be used in higher education institutions and universities to create new businesses       [24]     An evaluation model for an entrepreneurship domains     Fiuzzy AHP     The model can be used an accurate, effective, and s		Measuring the local entrepreneurial	Survey and	It evaluates an entrepreneurial culture at a local
researchresearch[12]Measuring the internationalSurvey and analyticaloperationalisation of international entrepreneurship[13]Investigating the family entrepreneurship culture, entrepreneurship culture, entrepreneurship cultureAnalytical researchIt develops foresight by considering both the community and business spects as part of a coherent whole[18]The importance of education in the development of entrepreneurship culture anong studentsSurvey and analyticalIt emphasizes the importance of promoting entrepreneurship culture anong students[19]The special programme's impact on among studentsSurvey and researchIt discovers that the entrepreneurial skills and interests of students are enhanced at the end of the programme[20]Entrepreneurial culture by using participative observation methodologyIt reveals that the influence of Arab culture on observation the tertepreneurial culture of researchIt emphasizes the importance of promoting the research entrepreneurial knowledge in various areas of entrepreneurial culture of research[21]Entrepreneuring domains researchThe fuzzy AIP and fuzzy TOPSIS[22]Detecting the fuzzy methods used in entrepreneurial downowledge in various areas of entrepreneurial (intervision support tool)[23]Detecting the primary screening of a usities to research[24]An evaluation model for an entrepreneurial method[25]Detecting the period entrepreneurial cultures[26]Detecting the period entrepreneurial brain[27]Detecting the period	[11]	culture	analytical	level
Measuring the international entrepreneurial cultureSurvey and analytical researchIt proposes a comprehensive opportunity-based operationalisation of international entrepreneurship culture, entrepreneurship culture, entrepreneurial intent, and futures foresightSurvey and analytical researchIt develops foresight by considering both the community and business aspects as part of a coherent whole[13]The importance of education in the development of entrepreneurial analytical cultureSurvey and analyticalIt emphasises the importance of promoting entrepreneurial values in people with secondary education level[18]development of entrepreneurial cultureSurvey and analyticalIt emphasises that the entrepreneurial skills and interests of students are enhanced at the end of increasing entrepreneurial culture of subservation methodologyIt emphasizes that the influence of Arab culture on methodology[21]Entrepreneurial culture in Singapore entrepreneurial universities of subdents are unanced at the end of researchIt empasizes the importance of promoting the entrepreneurial universities and fuzzy TOPSIs[22]Detecting the fuzzy methods used in entrepreneurial universities of actors that affect entrepreneurial investities affect entrepreneurial investities affect entrepreneurial investities affect entrepreneurial investities affect entrepreneurial investities affect entrepreneurial completencies model[24]An evaluation model for an entrepreneurial culture entrepreneurial intelligence factors that affect entrepreneurial intelligence factors that affect entrepreneurial intelligence factors that affect entrepreneurial intelligence fact			research	
[12]     entrepreneurial culture     analytical     operationalisation of international entrepreneurship       [13]     Investigating the family entrepreneurship culture, entrepreneurship culture, entrepreneurship culture, entrepreneurship culture     Analytical analytical     It develops foresight by considering both the community and business aspects as part of a coherent whole       [18]     The importance of education in the development of entrepreneural culture     Survey and analytical     It emphasises the importance of promoting entrepreneurship culture on the research       [19]     Increasing entrepreneurship culture among students     Survey and analytical     It emphasises the importance of promoting entrepreneurship culture on the enterprise creation process is significant       [20]     Detecting the fuzzy methods used in entrepreneurship domains     Analytical research     It emphasises the importance of promoting the entrepreneurship domains       [21]     Entrepreneurship domains     Fuzzy AHP     The results can be used in higher education institutions and universities to create new businesses       [22]     Detecting the personality traits and emtorpreneurship domains     Fuzzy AHP     The model can be used in higher education institutions and universities to create new businesses       [23]     An evaluation model for an ertepreneural and promoting the education affect entrepreneural intention     Fuzzy AHP       [24]     An ev		Measuring the international	Survey and	It proposes a comprehensive opportunity-based
Investigating the family entrepreneurship culture, entrepreneurship culture, foresightIt develops foresight by considering both the community and business aspects as part of a coherent whole[13] [13] entrepreneurshi tentent, and futures foresightSurvey and analytical researchIt emphasizes the importance of promoting entrepreneurial values in people with secondary education level[18] [19] [10] [20]The special programme's impact on increasing entrepreneurial culture onig studentsSurvey and analytical researchIt emphasizes the importance of promoting entrepreneurial skills and interests of students are enhanced at the end of the programme[20] [20]Ising participative observation methodologyParticipative observation methodologyIt emphasizes the importance of promoting the entrepreneurial culture in Singapore researchIt emphasizes the importance of promoting the entrepreneurial culture in Singapore aresar of entrepreneurial universities[21] [22]Entrepreneurial culture in Singapore entrepreneurial duriversitiesThe fuzzy MPH and fuzzy MPDThe results can be used in higher education institutions and universities to create new businesses[24] [25]An evaluation model for an entrepreneurial intelligence factors that affect entrepreneurial interventionFuzzy AHP and fuzzy AHPThe model can be used as an accurate, effective, and systematic decision support tool server significant factors[26] [26] [27]Developing the economic- peveloping the economic- modelFuzzy AHPThe model can be used as an accurate, effective, and systematic decision support tool servere	[12]	entrepreneurial culture	analytical	operationalisation of international
Investigating the family entrepreneurial polationAnalytical researchIt develops foresight community and business aspects as part of a coherent whole[18] [18]The importance of education in the development of entrepreneurial cultureSurvey and analytical researchIt emphasises the importance of promoting entrepreneurial values in people with secondary education level[19]The special programme's impact on arong studentsSurvey and analytical researchIt emphasises the entrepreneurial skills and interests of students are enhanced at the end of the programme[20]The special programme's impact on arong studentsSurvey and analytical researchIt discovers that the influence of Arab culture on the enterprise creation process is significant methodology.[21]Entrepreneurial culture in Singapore entrepreneurial potential culture of citizensAnalytical researchIt expenseurial culture of citizens[22]Detecting a versatile criterion set for evaluation model for an entrepreneurial environment affect entrepreneurial environment affect enterpeneurial environment motion intelligence factors that affect entrepreneurial computencies psychological model of factors that affect entrepreneurial computenciesNeuro-fuzzy AIP[22]Detecting the economic- psychological model of factors that affect entrepreneurial computenciesFuzzy DEMATEL[23]Developing the soft-computing-based motol sineligence factorsNeuro-fuzzy AIPThe model can be used as an accurate, effective, entrepreneurial intention[24]An evaluation model for an entrepreneurial environment m			research	entrepreneurship
[13]entrepreneurial intent, and futures foresightresearchcommunity and business aspects as part of a coherent whole[18]The importance of education in the development of entrepreneurial cultureSurvey and analytical researchIt emphasises the importance of promoting entrepreneurial values in people with secondary education level[19]The special programme's impact on increasing entrepreneurial culture origitude baservation methodologyIt discovers that the entrepreneurial skills and interests of students are enhanced at the end of the programme[20]by using participative observation methodologyParticipative researchIt discovers that the entrepreneurial estance[21]Entrepreneurial culture in Singapore evaluating entrepreneurial using participative observation methodologyIt emphasises the importance of promoting the entrepreneurial culture of citizens[22]Detecting the fuzzy methods used in entrepreneurial oduationsAnalytical researchIt acquires meaningful knowledge in various areas of entrepreneurial putworkedge in various areas of entrepreneurial fultions and universities to create new businesses[23]Detecting a versatile criterion set for metoidal intentionThe fuzzy AHP and fuzzy TOPSISThe model can be used in higher education institutions and universities to create new businesses[24]An evaluation model for an entrepreneurial comptencies modelNeuro-fuzzyThe model can predict or evaluate the quality of the obtained entrepreneurial fractor that affect entrepreneurial entrepreneurial fractors that affect entrepreneurial going into business 		Investigating the family	Analytical	It develops foresight by considering both the
[19]   entrepreneurial intent, and futures for esight   coherent whole     [18]   The importance of education in the development of entrepreneurial culture   Survey and analytical research   It emphasises the importance of promoting entrepreneurial values in people with secondary education level     [19]   The special programme's impact on among students   Survey and analytical research   It discovers that the entrepreneurial skills and interests of students are enhanced at the end of the programme     [20]   Entrepreneurial culture by using participative observation methodology   Analytical research   It erests that the influence of Arab culture on the enterpreneurial culture of citizens     [21]   Entrepreneurial culture in Singapore research   Analytical research   It acquires meaningful knowledge in various areas of entrepreneurship domains     [22]   Detecting the fuzzy methods used in entrepreneurial environment therepreneurial environment fuzzy AHP   The ruzzy AHP and fuzzy TOPSIS   The ruzzy AHP and systematic decision-support tool the obtained entrepreneurial competencies model an eveloping the soft-computing-based key entrepreneurial intention     [26]   Reveloping the soft-computing-based model and the outpreneurial simeters of model   Neuro-fuzzy Pureption factors that affect entrepreneurial acompetencies model and outpreneurial intertion is related to a composite of various demographics, competencies, networks, and perception factors     [27]   Developing the soft-computing-based key entrepreneurial compete	[12]	entrepreneurship culture,	research	community and business aspects as part of a
foresightSurvey and analytical researchIt emphasises the importance of promoting entrepreneurial values in people with secondary education level[18]development of entrepreneurial cultureSurvey and analytical analytical increasing entrepreneurial cultureIt discovers that the entrepreneurial skills and interests of students are enhanced at the end of the programme[20]by using participative observation methodologyParticipative observation methodologyIt reveals that the influence of Arab culture on observation the enterprise creation process is significant[21]Entrepreneurial culture in Singapore enterpreneurial culture of critizensAnalytical researchIt emphasises the importance of promoting the enterpreneurial culture of critizens[22]Detecting the fuzzy methods used in entrepreneurial universities and fuzzy VDPSisIt acquires meaningful knowledge in various areas of entrepreneurish domains[23]evaluating entrepreneurial universities and fuzzy VDPSisThe model can be used as an accurate, effective, and fuzzy VDPSis[24]An evaluation model for an entrepreneurial intentionFuzzy DEMATEL tuzy VDEMATELIt determines the need for achievement as the model can predict or evaluate the quality of the obtained entrepreneurial competencies model[25]Developing the economic- psychological model of factors that affect entrepreneurial intentions of individuals going into businessFuzzy VAHP[26]Developing the economic- psychological model of factors that influence the intentions of individuals going into businessFuzzy VAHP[27]D	[13]	entrepreneurial intent, and futures		coherent whole
The importance of education in the cultureSurvey and analyticalIt emphasises the importance of promoting education level[18] culture culture among studentsThe special programme's impact on analyticalSurvey and analyticalIt discovers that the entrepreneurial skills and interests of students are enhanced at the end of research[19] increasing entrepreneurial culture among studentsParticipative observationIt discovers that the influence of Arab culture on observation[20] [21]Entrepreneurial culture in Singapore entrepreneurial culture of citizensAnalytical researchIt emphasises the importance of promoting the entrepreneurial culture of citizens[22] [23]Detecting a versatile criterion set for evaluating entrepreneurial universitiesThe fuzzy AHP and fuzzy TOPSIS and systematic decision-support tool[24] [24] [25]An evaluation model for an entrepreneurial environment fuzzy AHPThe results can be used as an accurate, effective, and systematic decision-support tool[26] [26] [26] [27]Developing the soft-computing-based key entrepreneurial indel of factors that influence the intentionNeuro-fuzzy fuzzy AHPThe model can be used in a opportunity of the obtained entrepreneurial interestion significant factor that affects entrepreneurial intention[27] [26] [26] [27]Developing the soft-computing-based key entrepreneurial factors that influence the intention of individuals going into businessNeuro-fuzzy fuzzy Lew[27] [27] [28] [29] [29]Making the primary screening of a business opportunity affected by ser		foresight		
[18]   development of entrepreneurial culture   analytical research   entrepreneurial values in people with secondary education level     [19]   The special programme's impact on increasing entrepreneurship culture   Survey and analytical analytical   It discovers that the entrepreneurial skills and interests of students are enhanced at the end of the programme     [20]   by using participative observation methodology   Participative observation   It reveals that the influence of Arab culture on observation methodology     [21]   Entrepreneurial culture in Singapore entrepreneurial go the entrepreneurial culture of true research   It emphasises the importance of promoting the entrepreneurial knowledge in various eresearch     [22]   Detecting the fuzzy methods used in entrepreneurial universities   Analytical areas of entrepreneurial knowledge in various eresearch     [23]   Detecting a versatile criterion set for evaluation model for an entrepreneurial environment   The fuzzy AHP fuzzy VENATEL   The model can bused in higher education institutions and universities to create new businesses     [24]   An evaluation model for an entrepreneurial environment   Fuzzy VENATEL   The model can bused as an accurate, effective, and systematic decision-support tool     [25]   Developing the soft-computing-based model   Neuro-fuzzy   The model can predict or evaluate the quality of the obtained entrepreneurial intention     [26]   Key entrepreneurial complexity of		The importance of education in the	Survey and	It emphasises the importance of promoting
cultureresearcheducation level[19]The special programme's impact on increasing entrepreneurial culture among studentsSurvey and interests of students are enhanced at the end of the programme[20]Investigating entrepreneurial culture by using participative observation methodologyParticipative observationIt discovers that the entrepreneurial skills and interests of students are enhanced at the end of the programme[21]Entrepreneurial culture in Singapore entrepreneurial culture in Singapore researchAnalytical researchIt acquires meaningful knowledge in various areas of entrepreneurship domains[22]Detecting a versatile criterion set for entrepreneurial environment entrepreneurial universitiesThe results can be used in an accurate, effective, and fuzzy AHP[24]An evaluation model for an entrepreneurial competenciesFuzzy Sets and fuzzy AHPThe model can be used as an accurate, effective, and systematic decision-support tool[26]Developing the soft-computing-based key entrepreneurial competenciesNeuro-fuzzyThe model can predict or evaluate the quality of the obtained entrepreneurial intention[27]Developing the soft-computing-based key entrepreneurial competenciesNeuro-fuzzyThe model significant dator that affects entrepreneurial influence devinous demographics, competencies, networks, and going into business[27]Developing the conomic- psychological model of factors that influence the intention of individuals going into businessFuzzy AHPThe model can previse intervine[28]Making the primary screening of a serveral	[18]	development of entrepreneurial	analytical	entrepreneurial values in people with secondary
[19]The special programme's impact on increasing entrepreneurship culture among studentsSurvey and analytical researchIt discovers that the entrepreneurial skills and investigating entrepreneurial culture observation methodology[20]by using participative observation methodologyParticipative observation methodologyIt erveals that the influence of Arab culture on the enterprise creation process is significant methodology[21]Entrepreneurial culture in Singapore anterpreneurship domainsAnalytical researchIt erveals that the influence of promoting the entrepreneurship domains[22]Detecting the fuzzy methods used in entrepreneurship domainsAnalytical researchIt acquires meaningful knowledge in various araes of entrepreneurship domains[23]Detecting a versatile criterion set for evaluating entrepreneurial universitiesThe fuzzy AHP and fuzzy TOPSISThe rosults can be used as an accurate, effective, and systematic decision-support tool[24]An evaluation model for an entrepreneurial intentionFuzzy DEMATEL tuzzy AIPIt determines the need for achievement as the motional intention[26]Developing the soft-computing-based modelNeuro-fuzzyThe model suggests that entrepreneurial complexities to real the quality of the obtained entrepreneurial influence the intentions of individuals going into businessFuzzy AHP[27]Developing the economic- psychological model of factors that influence the intentions of individuals going into businessFuzzy AHP[28]Developing the economic- psychological model of factors that influence the inte		culture	research	education level
[19]increasing entrepreneurship culture among studentsanalytical researchinterests of students are enhanced at the end of the programme[20]Investigating entrepreneurial culture by using participative observation methodologyParticipative observationIt reveals that the influence of Arab culture on the enterprise creation process is significant[21]Entrepreneurial culture in Singapore entrepreneurship domainsAnalytical researchIt emphasises the importance of promoting the entrepreneurship domains[22]Detecting a versatile criterion set for evaluating entrepreneurial universitiesAnalytical researchIt emphasises to iscue in higher education institutions and universities to create new businesses[24]An evaluation model for an entrepreneurial environmentFuzzy AHP fuzzy AHP Fuzzy DEMATELThe model can be used as an accurate, effective, and systematic decision-support tool[25]Developing the soft-computing-based modelNeuro-fuzzyThe model can predict or evaluate the quality of the obtained entrepreneurial competencies model[27]Developing the economic- psychological model of factors that a fifuence the intentions of individuals going into business going into businessFuzzy AHP[28]Determining the necessary and sufficient conditions for higher entrepreneurial ratesFuzzy AHP[29]Categorising the entrepreneurial several factorsFuzzy Qualitative analysis[21]Developing the conomic- psychological model of factors that influence the intentions of higher entrepreneurial atset[23]Developing		The special programme's impact on	Survey and	It discovers that the entrepreneurial skills and
among studentsresearchthe programme[20]Investigating entrepreneurial culture by using participative observation methodologyIt reveals that the influence of Arab culture on the enterprise creation process is significant[21]Entrepreneurial culture in Singapore entrepreneurial culture of citizensAnalytical researchIt emphasises the importance of promoting the entrepreneurial culture of citizens[22]Detecting the fuzzy methods used in entrepreneurship domainsAnalytical researchIt acquires meaningful knowledge in various areas of entrepreneurship domains[23]Detecting a versatile criterion set for evaluating entrepreneurial universities entrepreneurial environmentFuzzy AHP fuzzy AHPThe results can be used as an accurate, effective, and systematic decision-support tool[24]An evaluation model for an entrepreneurial intentionFuzzy DEWATELIt determines the need for achievement as the most significant factor that affects entrepreneurial intention[26]Developing the economic- modelFuzzy logicThe model can predict or evaluate the quality of the obtained entrepreneurial competencies from various entrepreneurial science, networks, and perception factors[27]Developing the economic- psychological model of factors that influence the intentions of individuals going into businessFuzzy AHPThe model can predict or evaluate the quality of the obtained entrepreneurial intention is related to an opportunity factor stude that and programmes[27]Developing the economic- psychological model of factors that influence the intentions of individuals going into business <td>[19]</td> <td>increasing entrepreneurship culture</td> <td>analytical</td> <td>interests of students are enhanced at the end of</td>	[19]	increasing entrepreneurship culture	analytical	interests of students are enhanced at the end of
[20]Investigating entrepreneurial culture by using participative observation methodologyIt reveals that the influence of Arab culture on the enterprise creation process is significant methodology[21]Entrepreneurial culture in Singapore entrepreneurship domainsAnalytical researchIt emphasises the importance of promoting the entrepreneurship domains[22]Detecting the fuzzy methods used in entrepreneurship domainsAnalytical researchIt acquires meaningful knowledge in various areas of entrepreneurship domains[23]Detecting a versatile criterion set for evaluating entrepreneurial universitiesThe fuzzy AHP and fuzzy TOPSISThe rosults can be used in higher education institutions and universities to create new businesses[24]An evaluation model for an entrepreneurial environmentFuzzy AHP fuzzy AHPThe model can be used as an accurate, effective, and systematic decision-support tool[25]Detecting the personality traits and affect entrepreneurial intentionFuzzy DEMATEL fuzzy DEMATELThe model can predict or evaluate the quality of the obtained entrepreneurial competencies from warious entrepreneurial competencies from model[27]Developing the economic- psychological model of factors that going into business going into businessFuzzy AHPThe model can be useful for entrepreneurial intention is related to a composite of various demographics, competencies, networks, and perception factors[28]Detecting the neterpreserand factor that factsFuzzy DEMATELThe model can be useful for entrepreneurial intention and core portunity[29]Categorising the entre		among students	research	the programme
[20]by using participative observation methodologyobservation methodologythe enterprise creation process is significant[21]Entrepreneurial culture in Singapore entrepreneurial culture of citizensIt emphasises the importance of promoting the entrepreneurial culture of citizens[22]Detecting the fuzzy methods used in entrepreneurship domainsAnalytical researchIt acquires meaningful knowledge in various areas of entrepreneurship domains[23]Detecting a versatile criterion set for evaluating entrepreneurial environment entrepreneurial environmentThe fuzzy AHP and fuzzy AHP and fuzzy AHP and systematic decision-support tool[24]An evaluation model for an entrepreneurial environmentFuzzy AHP fuzzy AHPThe model can be used as an accurate, effective, and systematic decision-support tool[25]Detecting the personality traits and emotional intelligence factors that affect entrepreneurial intentionFuzzy DEMATELIt determines the need for achievement as the most significant factor that affects entrepreneurial intention[27]Developing the soft-computing-based key entrepreneurial intentions of individuals going into businessNeuro-fuzzy fuzzy AHPThe model can predict or evaluate the quality of various entrepreneurship training programmes[27]Developing the economic- psychological model of factors that influence the intentions for individuals going into businessFuzzy AHPThe model can be useful for entrepreneurial service experts who have knowledge about factors related to a composite of various demographics, competencies, networks, and perception factors[27] <td< td=""><td></td><td>Investigating entrepreneurial culture</td><td>Participative</td><td>It reveals that the influence of Arab culture on</td></td<>		Investigating entrepreneurial culture	Participative	It reveals that the influence of Arab culture on
methodologymethodology[21]Entrepreneurial culture in SingaporeAnalytical researchIt emphasises the importance of promoting the entrepreneurial culture of citizens[22]Detecting the fuzzy methods used in entrepreneurship domainsAnalytical researchIt entrepreneurial culture of citizens[23]Detecting a versatile criterion set for evaluating entrepreneurial universitiesThe fuzzy AHP and fuzzy TOPSISThe results can be used in higher education institutions and universities to create new businesses[24]An evaluation model for an entrepreneurial environmentFuzzy sets and fuzzy AHPThe model can be used as an accurate, effective, and systematic decision-support tool[25]Detecting the personality traits and emotional intelligence factors that affect entrepreneurial competenciesFuzzy DEMATELIt determines the need for a chievement as the most significant factor that affects entrepreneurial intention[26]Developing the soft-computing-based key entrepreneurial competenciesNeuro-fuzzyThe model can be useful for envaluate the quality of the obtained entrepreneurial intention is related to a composite of various demographics, competencies, networks, and going into business[27]Developing the conomic- psychological model of factors that influence the intentions of individuals going into businessFuzzy AHPThe model can be useful for entrepreneurial intention is related to a composite of various demographics, competencies, networks, and geregition factors[28]Making the primary screening of a sufficient conditions for higher entrepreneurial ratesFuzzy AHP<	[20]	by using participative observation	observation	the enterprise creation process is significant
[21]Entrepreneurial culture in Singapore researchAnalytical researchIt emphasises the importance of promoting the entrepreneuriship domains[22]Detecting the fuzzy methods used in entrepreneurship domainsAnalytical researchIt acquires meaningful knowledge in various areas of entrepreneurship domains[23]Detecting a versatile criterion set for evaluating entrepreneurial universitiesThe fuzzy AHP and fuzzy TOPSISThe results can be used in higher education institutions and universities to create new businesses[24]An evaluation model for an entrepreneurial environmentFuzzy sets and fuzzy AHPThe model can be used as an accurate, effective, and systematic decision-support tool[25]Detecting the personality traits and entrepreneurial intentionFuzzy DEMATELIt determines the need for achievement as the most significant factor that affects entrepreneurial intention[26]Key entrepreneurial competencies modelNeuro-fuzzyThe model can predict or evaluate the quality of the obtained entrepreneurial competencies from various entrepreneurial competencies from various entrepreneurial competencies for model[27]Developing the economic- psychological model of factors that influence the intentions of individuals going into businessFuzzy AHPThe model can be useful for entrepreneurial intention is related to a composite of various demographics, competencies, networks, and gereption factors[28]Several factorsFuzzy AHPThe model can be useful for entrepreneurial service experts who have knowledge about factors related to a opotunity[29]Categorising t		methodology	methodology	
[21]researchentrepreneurial culture of citizens[22]Detecting the fuzzy methods used in entrepreneurship domainsAnalytical researchIt acquires meaningful knowledge in various areas of entrepreneurship domains[23]Detecting a versatile criterion set for evaluating entrepreneurial universitiesThe fuzzy APP and fuzzy TOPSISThe results can be used in higher education institutions and universities to create new businesses[24]An evaluation model for an entrepreneurial environmentFuzzy sets and fuzzy AHPThe model can be used as an accurate, effective, and systematic decision-support tool[25]Detecting the personality traits and affect entrepreneurial competencies modelFuzzy DEWATELIt determines the need for achievement as the most significant factor that affects entrepreneurial competencies from various entrepreneurial competencies from various entrepreneurial competencies from various entrepreneurial influence the intentions of individuals going into businessNeuro-fuzzyThe model can be useful for entrepreneurial intencient en intentions of individuals going into business[27]Making the primary screening of a business opportunity affected by several factorsFuzzy AHPThe model can be useful for entrepreneurial intencient shat the dia attention to entrepreneurship.[28]Determining the necessary and sufficient conditions for higher entrepreneurial ratesFuzzy Qualitative analysisThe model can be useful for mangement and perceived opportunity affected by several factors[29]Categorising the entrepreneurial barriers in the industry of IranFuzzy DEWATEL F	[21]	Entrepreneurial culture in Singapore	Analytical	It emphasises the importance of promoting the
[22]Detecting the fuzzy methods used in entrepreneurship domainsAnalytical researchIt acquires meaningful knowledge in various areas of entrepreneurship domains[23]Detecting a versatile criterion set for evaluating entrepreneurial universitiesThe fuzzy AHP and fuzzy TOPSISThe results can be used in higher education institutions and universities to create new businesses[24]An evaluation model for an entrepreneurial environmentFuzzy sets and fuzzy AHPThe model can be used as an accurate, effective, and systematic decision-support tool[25]Detecting the personality traits and emotional intelligence factors that affect entrepreneurial intentionFuzzy DEMATELIt determines the need for achievement as the most significant factor that affects entrepreneurial intention[26]Developing the soft-computing-based key entrepreneurial competenciesNeuro-fuzzyThe model can predict or evaluate the quality of the obtained entrepreneurial competencies from various entrepreneurial influence the intentions of individuals going into businessFuzzy logicThe model can be useful for entrepreneurial intention is related to a composite of various demographics, competencies, networks, and perception factors[27]Determining the necessary and sufficient conditions for higher entrepreneurial ratesFuzzy QEMATELThe model can be useful for entrepreneurial iservice experts who have knowledge about factors related to an opportunity[28]Determining the necessary and sufficient conditions for higher entrepreneurial ratesFuzzy AHPThe model demonstrates that the most important factors are the kind of management and	[21]		research	entrepreneurial culture of citizens
[24]entrepreneurship domainsresearch researchareas of entrepreneurship domains[23]Detecting a versatile criterion set for evaluating entrepreneurial universitiesThe fuzzy APP and fuzzy TOPSISThe results can be used in higher education institutions and universities to create new businesses[24]An evaluation model for an entrepreneurial environmentFuzzy sets and fuzzy AHPThe model can be used as an accurate, effective, and systematic decision-support tool[25]emotional intelligence factors that affect entrepreneurial intentionFuzzy DEMATELIt determines the need for achievement as the most significant factor that affects entrepreneurial intention[26]beveloping the soft-computing-based key entrepreneurial competencies modelNeuro-fuzzyThe model can predict or evaluate the quality of the obtained entrepreneurial competencies, networks, and perception factors that influence the intentions of individuals going into business[27]Developing the economic- psychological model of factors that influence the intentions of individuals going into business opportunity affected by several factorsFuzzy AHPThe model can be useful for entrepreneurial service experts who have knowledge about factors related to a opportunity.[28]Making the primary screening of a business opportunity affected by several factors for the industry of IranFuzzy DEMATELThe model demonstrates that the most important factors are the kind of management and organisational structure[30]Categorising the entrepreneurial social entrepreneurshipFuzzy AHPThe model demonstrates that the most important fact	[22]	Detecting the fuzzy methods used in	Analytical	It acquires meaningful knowledge in various
Detecting a versatile criterion set for evaluating entrepreneurial universitiesThe fuzzy AHP and fuzzy TOPSISThe results can be used in higher education institutions and universities to create new businesses[24]An evaluation model for an entrepreneurial environmentFuzzy sets and fuzzy AHP and systematic decision-support toolThe model can be used as an accurate, effective, and systematic decision-support tool[25]Detecting the personality traits and emotional intelligence factors that affect entrepreneurial intentionFuzzy DEMATELIt determines the need for achievement as the most significant factor that affects entrepreneurial intention[26]Developing the soft-computing-based modelNeuro-fuzzyThe model can predict or evaluate the quality of the obtained entrepreneurship training programmes[27]Developing the economic- psychological model of factors that influence the intentions of individuals going into businessFuzzy AHPThe model can be useful for entrepreneurial intention is related to a composite of various demographics, competencies, networks, and perception factors[28]Making the primary screening of a sufficient conditions for higher entrepreneurial ratesFuzzy Qualitative analysisThe model can be useful for entrepreneurial actors related to a opportunity apabilities, and perceived opportunities are the most relevant conditions[30]Categorising the entrepreneurial barriers in the industry of IranFuzzy SetsThe model demonstrates that the most important factors are the kind of management and organisational structure[31]The local institutional complexity of social entrepreneu	[22]	entrepreneurship domains	research	areas of entrepreneurship domains
[23]evaluating entrepreneurial universitiesand fuzzy TOPSISinstitutions and universities to create new businesses[24]An evaluation model for an entrepreneurial environmentFuzzy sets and fuzzy AHPThe model can be used as an accurate, effective, and systematic decision-support tool[25]Detecting the personality traits and emotional intelligence factors that affect entrepreneurial intentionFuzzy DEMATELIt determines the need for achievement as the most significant factor that affects entrepreneurial intention[26]Developing the soft-computing-based key entrepreneurial competencies modelNeuro-fuzzyThe model can predict or evaluate the quality of the obtained entrepreneurial intention[27]Developing the economic- psychological model of factors that influence the intentions of individuals going into businessFuzzy AHPThe model suggests that entrepreneurial intention is related to a composite of various demographics, competencies, networks, and perception factors[28]business opportunity affected by several factorsFuzzy Qualitative analysisThe model can be useful for entrepreneurial service experts who have knowledge about factors related to an opportunity[29]Determining the necessary and sufficient conditions for higher entrepreneurial ratesFuzzy DEMATELThe model demonstrates that the most important factors are the kind of management and organisational structure[30]Categorising the entrepreneurial social entrepreneurshipFuzzy AHPThe results show that local authorities are a dominant condition, and local institutions need to be in place to encourage the advancem		Detecting a versatile criterion set for	The fuzzy AHP	The results can be used in higher education
[24]An evaluation model for an entrepreneurial environmentFuzzy sets and fuzzy AHPThe model can be used as an accurate, effective, and systematic decision-support tool[25]Detecting the personality traits and emotional intelligence factors that affect entrepreneurial intentionFuzzy DEMATELIt determines the need for achievement as the most significant factor that affects entrepreneurial intention[26]Developing the soft-computing-based key entrepreneurial competenciesNeuro-fuzzyThe model can predict or evaluate the quality of the obtained entrepreneurial competencies from various entrepreneurial intention[27]Developing the economic- psychological model of factors that influence the intentions of individuals going into businessFuzzy logicThe model suggests that entrepreneurial intention is related to a composite of various demographics, competencies, networks, and perception factors[28]Making the primary screening of a business opportunity affected by several factorsFuzzy Qualitative analysisThe fuzzy analysis identifies that media attention to entrepreneurship, perceived capabilities, and perceived opportunities are the most relevant conditions[29]Categorising the entrepreneurial barriers in the industry of IranFuzzy DEMATELThe model demostrates that the most important factors are the kind of management and organisational structure[31]The local institutional complexity of social entrepreneurshipFuzzy AHPThe results show thal local authorities are a dominant condition, and local institutions need to be in place to encourage the advancement of social entrepreneurship	[23]	evaluating entrepreneurial universities	and fuzzy TOPSIS	institutions and universities to create new
[24]An evaluation model for an entrepreneurial environmentFuzzy sets and fuzzy AHPThe model can be used as an accurate, effective, and systematic decision-support tool[25]Detecting the personality traits and emotional intelligence factors that affect entrepreneurial intentionFuzzy DEMATELIt determines the need for achievement as the most significant factor that affects entrepreneurial intention[26]Developing the soft-computing-based key entrepreneurial competencies modelNeuro-fuzzyThe model can predict or evaluate the quality of the obtained entrepreneurial competencies from various entrepreneurial competencies[27]Developing the economic- psychological model of factors that influence the intentions of individuals going into business sufficient conditions of higher entrepreneurial factorsFuzzy AHPThe model can be useful for entrepreneurial business opportunity affected by several factors[28]Making the primary screening of a business opportunity affected by several factorsFuzzy pulitative analysisThe fuzzy analysis identifies that media attention to entrepreneurial, sufficient conditions for higher entrepreneurial ratesFuzzy DEMATELThe model demonstrates that the most important factors are the kind of management and organisational structure[30]Categorising the entrepreneurial barriers in the industry of IranFuzzy AHPThe results show that local authorities are a dominant conditions[31]The local institutional complexity of social entrepreneurial cotal entrepreneurialFuzzy AHPThe approach categorises the firms based on social entrepreneurial				businesses
C 1entrepreneural environmentTuzzy AHPand systematic decision-support toolDetecting the personality traits and emotional intelligence factors that affect entrepreneurial intentionFuzzy DEMATELIt determines the need for achievement as the most significant factor that affects entrepreneurial intention[26]Developing the soft-computing-based key entrepreneurial competencies modelNeuro-fuzzyThe model can predict or evaluate the quality of the obtained entrepreneurial competencies from various entrepreneurial intention is related to a composite of various demographics, competencies, networks, and perception factors[27]Developing the economic- psychological model of factors that influence the intentions of individuals going into businessFuzzy AHPThe model can busines, networks, and perception factors[28]Developing the necessary and sufficient conditions for higher entrepreneurial ratesFuzzy qualitative analysisThe fuzzy analysis identifies that media attention to entrepreneuriship, perceived capabilities, and percueived opportunities are the most relevant conditions[30]Categorising the entrepreneurial bariers in the industry of IranFuzzy DEMATELThe roodel demonstrates that the most important factors are the kind of management and organisational structure[31]An approach to measuring and perceneurshipFuzzy AHPThe results show that local authorities are a dominant condition, and local institutions need to be in place to encourage the advancement of social entrepreneurship	[24]	An evaluation model for an	Fuzzy sets and	The model can be used as an accurate, effective,
Detecting the personality traits and emotional intelligence factors that affect entrepreneurial intentionFuzzy DEMATELIt determines the need for achievement as the most significant factor that affects entrepreneurial intention[26]Developing the soft-computing-based key entrepreneurial competencies modelNeuro-fuzzyThe model can predict or evaluate the quality of the obtained entrepreneurial competencies from various entrepreneurial competencies, networks, and perception factors[27]Developing the economic- psychological model of factors that influence the intentions of individuals going into businessFuzzy logicThe model suggests that entrepreneurial intention is related to a composite of various demographics, competencies, networks, and perception factors[28]Making the primary screening of a business opportunity affected by several factorsFuzzy qualitative analysisThe model can be useful for entrepreneurial service experts who have knowledge about factors related to an opportunity[29]Determining the necessary and sufficient conditions for higher entrepreneurial ratesFuzzy DEMATELThe model demonstrates that the most important factors are the kind of management and organisational structure[30]Categorising the entrepreneurial barriers in the industry of IranFuzzy AHPThe results show that local authorities are a dominant condition, and local institutions need to barriers in the industry of Iran[31]The local institutional complexity of social entrepreneurshipFuzzy AHPThe results show that local authorities are a dominant condition, and local institutions need to be in place to encourage the advancement		entrepreneurial environment	fuzzy AHP	and systematic decision-support tool
[25]emotional intelligence factors that affect entrepreneurial intentionmost significant factor that affects entrepreneurial intention[26]Developing the soft-computing-based key entrepreneurial competencies modelNeuro-fuzzyThe model can predict or evaluate the quality of the obtained entrepreneurial competencies from various entrepreneurship training programmes[27]Developing the economic- psychological model of factors that influence the intentions of individualsFuzzy logicThe model suggests that entrepreneurial intention is related to a composite of various demographics, competencies, networks, and perception factors[28]Making the primary screening of a business opportunity affected by several factorsFuzzy AHPThe model can be useful for entrepreneurial service experts who have knowledge about factors related to an opportunity[29]Determining the necessary and sufficient conditions for higher entrepreneurial ratesFuzzy Qualitative analysisThe model demostrates that the most important factors are the kind of management and organisational structure[30]Categorising the entrepreneurial social entrepreneurshipFuzzy SetsThe results show that local authorities are a dominant condition, and local institutions need to be in place to encourage the advancement of social entrepreneurship[31]An approach to measuringFuzzy AHPThe approach categorises the firms based on various entrepreneurship	50.51	Detecting the personality traits and	Fuzzy DEMATEL	It determines the need for achievement as the
affect entrepreneural intentionentrepreneural intention[26]Developing the soft-computing-based key entrepreneurial competencies modelNeuro-fuzzyThe model can predict or evaluate the quality of the obtained entrepreneurial competencies from various entrepreneuriship training programmes[27]Developing the economic- psychological model of factors that influence the intentions of individuals going into businessFuzzy logicThe model suggests that entrepreneurial intention is related to a composite of various demographics, competencies, networks, and perception factors[28]Making the primary screening of a business opportunity affected by several factorsFuzzy AHPThe model can be useful for entrepreneurial service experts who have knowledge about factors related to a opportunity[29]Determining the necessary and sufficient conditions for higher entrepreneurial tatesFuzzy Qualitative analysisThe fuzzy analysis identifies that media attention to entrepreneurship, perceived capabilities, and perceived opportunities are the most relevant conditions[30]Categorising the entrepreneurial barriers in the industry of IranFuzzy setsThe results show that local authorities are a dominant condition, and local institutions need to be in place to encourage the advancement of social entrepreneurship[31]An approach to measuring entrepreneurshipFuzzy AHPThe approach categorises the firms based on urpreneurship	[25]	emotional intelligence factors that		most significant factor that affects
Developing the soft-computing-based key entrepreneurial competencies modelNeuro-fuzzyThe model can predict or evaluate the quality of the obtained entrepreneurial competencies from various entrepreneurship training programmes[27]Developing the economic- psychological model of factors that influence the intentions of individuals going into businessFuzzy logicThe model suggests that entrepreneurial intention is related to a composite of various demographics, competencies, networks, and perception factors[28]Making the primary screening of a business opportunity affected by several factorsFuzzy AHPThe model can pediction factors that intention is related to an opportunity[29]Determining the necessary and sufficient conditions for higher entrepreneurial ratesFuzzy Qualitative analysisThe fuzzy analysis identifies that media attention to entrepreneurship, perceived capabilities, and perceived opportunities are the most relevant conditions[30]Categorising the entrepreneurial barriers in the industry of IranFuzzy DEMATELThe model demonstrates that the most important factors are the kind of management and organisational structure[31]The local institutional complexity of social entrepreneurshipFuzzy AHPThe results show that local authorities are a dominant condition, and local institutions need to be in place to encourage the advancement of social entrepreneurship[32]An approach to measuring entrepreneurshipFuzzy AHPThe approach categorises the firms based on social entrepreneurship		affect entrepreneurial intention		entrepreneurial intention
[26]key entrepreneural competencies modelthe obtained entrepreneural competencies from various entrepreneurship training programmes[27]Developing the economic- psychological model of factors that influence the intentions of individuals going into businessFuzzy logicThe model suggests that entrepreneural intention is related to a composite of various demographics, competencies, networks, and perception factors[28]Making the primary screening of a business opportunity affected by several factorsFuzzy AHPThe model can be useful for entrepreneural service experts who have knowledge about factors related to an opportunity[29]Determining the necessary and sufficient conditions for higher entrepreneurial ratesFuzzy qualitative analysisThe fuzzy analysis identifies that media attention to entrepreneurship, perceived capabilities, and perceived opportunities are the most relevant conditions[30]Categorising the entrepreneurial social entrepreneurshipFuzzy SetsThe model demonstrates that the most important factors are the kind of management and organisational structure[31]The local institutional complexity of social entrepreneurshipFuzzy AHPThe esults show that local authorities are a dominant condition, and local institutions need to be in place to encourage the advancement of social entrepreneurship[32]An approach to measuring entrepreneurshipFuzzy AHPThe approach categorises the firms based on social entrepreneurship	FO (1	Developing the soft-computing-based	Neuro-fuzzy	The model can predict or evaluate the quality of
Image: ModelVarious entrepreneurship training programmesDeveloping the economic- psychological model of factors that influence the intentions of individuals going into businessFuzzy logicThe model suggests that entrepreneurial intention is related to a composite of various demographics, competencies, networks, and perception factors[28]Making the primary screening of a business opportunity affected by several factorsFuzzy AHPThe model can be useful for entrepreneurial service experts who have knowledge about factors related to an opportunity[29]Determining the necessary and sufficient conditions for higher entrepreneurial ratesFuzzy qualitative analysisThe fuzzy analysis identifies that media attention to entrepreneurship, perceived capabilities, and perceived opportunities are the most relevant conditions[30]Categorising the entrepreneurial barriers in the industry of IranFuzzy DEMATELThe model demonstrates that the most important factors are the kind of management and organisational structure[31]The local institutional complexity of social entrepreneurshipFuzzy AHPThe results show that local authorities are a dominant condition, and local institutions need to be in place to encourage the advancement of social entrepreneurship[32]An approach to measuring entrepreneurshipFuzzy AHPThe approach categorises the firms based on social entrepreneurship	[26]	key entrepreneurial competencies		the obtained entrepreneurial competencies from
[27]Developing the economic- psychological model of factors that influence the intentions of individuals going into businessFuzzy logicThe model suggests that entrepreneurial intention is related to a composite of various demographics, competencies, networks, and perception factors[28]Making the primary screening of a business opportunity affected by several factorsFuzzy AHPThe model can be useful for entrepreneurial service experts who have knowledge about factors related to a opportunity[29]Determining the necessary and sufficient conditions for higher entrepreneurial ratesFuzzy qualitative analysisThe fuzzy analysis identifies that media attention to entrepreneurship, perceived capabilities, and perceived opportunities are the most relevant conditions[30]Categorising the entrepreneurial barriers in the industry of IranFuzzy DEMATELThe model demonstrates that the most important factors are the kind of management and organisational structure[31]The local institutional complexity of social entrepreneurshipFuzzy AHPThe results show that local authorities are a dominant condition, and local institutions need to be in place to encourage the advancement of social entrepreneurship[32]An approach to measuring entrepreneurship entrepreneurshipFuzzy AHPThe approach categorises the firms based on entrepreneurship		model		various entrepreneurship training programmes
[27]psychological model of factors that influence the intentions of individuals going into businessinfluence the intentions of individuals demographics, competencies, networks, and perception factors[28]Making the primary screening of a business opportunity affected by several factorsFuzzy AHPThe model can be useful for entrepreneurial service experts who have knowledge about factors related to an opportunity[29]Determining the necessary and sufficient conditions for higher entrepreneurial ratesFuzzy qualitative analysisThe fuzzy analysis identifies that media attention to entrepreneurship, perceived capabilities, and perceived opportunities are the most relevant conditions[30]Categorising the entrepreneurial barriers in the industry of IranFuzzy DEMATELThe model demonstrates that the most important factors are the kind of management and organisational structure[31]The local institutional complexity of social entrepreneurshipFuzzy AHPThe results show that local authorities are a dominant condition, and local institutions need to be in place to encourage the advancement of social entrepreneurship[32]An approach to measuring entrepreneurship entreptionFuzzy AHPThe approach categorises the firms based on entrepreneurship		Developing the economic-	Fuzzy logic	I ne model suggests that entrepreneurial
1   influence the intentions or individuals going into business   demographics, competencies, networks, and perception factors     1   Making the primary screening of a business opportunity affected by several factors   Fuzzy AHP   The model can be useful for entrepreneurial service experts who have knowledge about factors related to an opportunity     1   Determining the necessary and sufficient conditions for higher entrepreneurial rates   Fuzzy qualitative analysis   The fuzzy analysis identifies that media attention to entrepreneurship, perceived opportunities are the most relevant conditions     1   Categorising the entrepreneurial barriers in the industry of Iran   Fuzzy DEMATEL   The model demonstrates that the most important factors are the kind of management and organisational structure     1   The local institutional complexity of social entrepreneurship   Fuzzy Sets   The results show that local authorities are a dominant condition, and local institutions need to be in place to encourage the advancement of social entrepreneurship     [32]   An approach to measuring entrepreneurship   Fuzzy AHP   The approach categories the firms based on entrepreneurship	[27]	psychological model of factors that		intention is related to a composite of various
going into business   perception factors     Making the primary screening of a business opportunity affected by several factors   Fuzzy AHP   The model can be useful for entrepreneurial service experts who have knowledge about factors related to an opportunity     [28]   Determining the necessary and sufficient conditions for higher entrepreneurial rates   Fuzzy qualitative analysis   The fuzzy analysis identifies that media attention to entrepreneurship, perceived capabilities, and perceived opportunities are the most relevant conditions     [30]   Categorising the entrepreneurial barriers in the industry of Iran   Fuzzy DEMATEL   The model demonstrates that the most important factors are the kind of management and organisational structure     [31]   The local institutional complexity of social entrepreneurship   Fuzzy AHP   The results show that local authorities are a dominant condition, and local institutions need to be in place to encourage the advancement of social entrepreneurship     [32]   An approach to measuring entrepreneurship entrepreneurship entrepreneurship   Fuzzy AHP   The approach categories the firms based on entrepreneurship		influence the intentions of individuals		demographics, competencies, networks, and
[28]Making the primary screening of a business opportunity affected by several factorsFuzzy AHPThe model can be useful for entrepreneurial service experts who have knowledge about factors related to an opportunity[29]Determining the necessary and sufficient conditions for higher entrepreneurial ratesFuzzy qualitative analysisThe fuzzy analysis identifies that media attention to entrepreneurship, perceived capabilities, and perceived opportunities are the most relevant conditions[30]Categorising the entrepreneurial barriers in the industry of IranFuzzy DEMATELThe model demonstrates that the most important factors are the kind of management and organisational structure[31]The local institutional complexity of social entrepreneurshipFuzzy setsThe results show that local authorities are a dominant condition, and local institutions need to be in place to encourage the advancement of social entrepreneurship[32]An approach to measuring entrepreneurshipFuzzy AHPThe approach categorises the firms based on social entrepreneurship		going into pusiness	Even AUD	The model can be useful for extreme with
[20]   Dustriess opportunity arrected by several factors   Service experts who have knowledge about factors related to an opportunity     [29]   Determining the necessary and sufficient conditions for higher entrepreneurial rates   Fuzzy qualitative analysis   The fuzzy analysis identifies that media attention to entrepreneurship, perceived capabilities, and perceived opportunities are the most relevant conditions     [30]   Categorising the entrepreneurial barriers in the industry of Iran   Fuzzy DEMATEL   The model demonstrates that the most important factors are the kind of management and organisational structure     [31]   The local institutional complexity of social entrepreneurship   Fuzzy sets   The results show that local authorities are a dominant condition, and local institutions need to be in place to encourage the advancement of social entrepreneurship     [32]   An approach to measuring entrepreneurship   Fuzzy AHP   The approach categorises the firms based on entrepreneurship	[20]	making the primary screening of a	ruzzy AMP	me model can be useful for entrepreneurial
[29]   Determining the necessary and sufficient conditions for higher entrepreneurial rates   Fuzzy qualitative analysis   The fuzzy analysis identifies that media attention to entrepreneurship, perceived capabilities, and perceived opportunities are the most relevant conditions     [30]   Categorising the entrepreneurial barriers in the industry of Iran   Fuzzy DEMATEL   The model demonstrates that the most important factors are the kind of management and organisational structure     [31]   The local institutional complexity of social entrepreneurship   Fuzzy sets   The results show that local authorities are a dominant condition, and local institutions need to be in place to encourage the advancement of social entrepreneurship     [32]   An approach to measuring entrepreneurship entrepreneurship entrepreneurship   Fuzzy AHP   The approach categorises the firms based on entrepreneurship	[28]	pusiness opportunity affected by		service experts who have knowledge about
[29]Determining the necessary and sufficient conditions for higher entrepreneurial ratesruzzy qualitative analysisIne ruzzy analysis identifies that media attention to entrepreneurship, perceived capabilities, and perceived opportunities are the most relevant conditions[30]Categorising the entrepreneurial barriers in the industry of IranFuzzy DEMATELThe model demonstrates that the most important factors are the kind of management and organisational structure[31]The local institutional complexity of social entrepreneurshipFuzzy setsThe results show that local authorities are a dominant condition, and local institutions need to be in place to encourage the advancement of social entrepreneurship[32]An approach to measuring entrepreneurship entrepreneurshipFuzzy AHPThe approach categorises the firms based on entrepreneurship		Several Idelets	Furzy qualitative	The furth analysis identifies that made
[29]   Sufficient conditions for higher entrepreneurial rates   anatysis   attention to entrepreneurship, perceived capabilities, and perceived opportunities are the most relevant conditions     [30]   Categorising the entrepreneurial barriers in the industry of Iran   Fuzzy DEMATEL   The model demonstrates that the most important factors are the kind of management and organisational structure     [31]   The local institutional complexity of social entrepreneurship   Fuzzy sets   The results show that local authorities are a dominant condition, and local institutions need to be in place to encourage the advancement of social entrepreneurship     [32]   An approach to measuring entrepreneurship entrepreneurship   Fuzzy AHP   The approach categorises the firms based on entrepreneurship		Determining the necessary and	ruzzy qualitative	the fuzzy analysis identifies that media
[30]   Categorising the entrepreneurial barriers in the industry of Iran   Fuzzy DEMATEL   The model demonstrates that the most important factors are the kind of management and organisational structure     [31]   The local institutional complexity of social entrepreneurship   Fuzzy sets   The results show that local authorities are a dominant condition, and local institutions need to be in place to encourage the advancement of social entrepreneurship     [32]   An approach to measuring entrepreneurship entrepreneurship entrepreneurship entrepreneurship entrepreneurship entrepreneurship entrepreneurship entrepreneurship entrepreneurship   Fuzzy AHP   The approach categorises the firms based on entrepreneurship entrepreneurship entrepreneurship entrepreneurship entrepreneurship entrepreneurship entrepreneurship	[29]	sufficient conditions for higher	analysis	attention to entrepreneurship, perceived
[30]   Categorising the entrepreneurial barriers in the industry of Iran   Fuzzy DEMATEL   The model demonstrates that the most important factors are the kind of management and organisational structure     [31]   The local institutional complexity of social entrepreneurship   Fuzzy sets   The results show that local authorities are a dominant condition, and local institutions need to be in place to encourage the advancement of social entrepreneurship     [32]   An approach to measuring entrepreneurship entrepreneurship entrepreneurship entrepreneurship entrepreneurship   Fuzzy AHP   The approach categorises the firms based on entrepreneurship entrepreneurship entrepreneurship		entrepreneurial rates		capabilities, and perceived opportunities are the
[30]   Categorisming the entrepreneurinat barriers in the industry of Iran   Fuzzy DEMATEL   The indust demonstrates that the most important factors are the kind of management and organisational structure     [31]   The local institutional complexity of social entrepreneurship   Fuzzy sets   The results show that local authorities are a dominant condition, and local institutions need to be in place to encourage the advancement of social entrepreneurship     [32]   An approach to measuring entrepreneurship entrepreneurship entrepreneurship entrepreneurship entrepreneurship   Fuzzy AHP   The approach categorises the firms based on entrepreneurship entrepreneurship entrepreneurship entrepreneurship entrepreneurship		Catagorizing the antropropourial		The model demonstrates that the most
[31] The local institutional complexity of social entrepreneurship Fuzzy sets The results show that local authorities are a dominant condition, and local institutions need to be in place to encourage the advancement of social entrepreneurship   [32] An approach to measuring entrepreneurship Fuzzy AHP The approach categorises the firms based on entrepreneurship entrepreneurship	[20]	barriers in the industry of Iran	I UZZY DEMATEL	important factors are the kind of management
[31] The local institutional complexity of social entrepreneurship Fuzzy sets The results show that local authorities are a dominant condition, and local institutions need to be in place to encourage the advancement of social entrepreneurship   [32] An approach to measuring entrepreneurship Fuzzy AHP The approach categorises the firms based on entrepreneurship entrepreneurship	[30]	barriers in the industry of fram		and organisational structure
[31] Inertocal institutional complexity of social entrepreneurship Fuzzy sets Interesults show that total authorities are a dominant condition, and local institutions need to be in place to encourage the advancement of social entrepreneurship   [32] An approach to measuring entrepreneurship entreprene		The local institutional complexity of	Fuzzy sots	The results show that local authorities are a
[31] Social entrepreneurship dominant condition, and tocal institutions need to be in place to encourage the advancement of social entrepreneurship   [32] An approach to measuring entrepreneurship entrepreneurship entrepreneurship entrepreneurship entrepreneurship entrepreneurship entrepreneurship entrepreneurship		social entrepreneurship	1 UZZY SELS	dominant condition and local institutions need
Image: Social entropy of the advancement of social entropy of	[31]	social end epieneai ship		to be in place to encourage the advancement of
An approach to measuring [32] An approach to measuring categorized and the second se				social entrepreneurship
[32] an upproach to measuring 1022y Air The approach categorises the fifths based of		An approach to measuring		The approach categorises the firms based on
I entrepreneurship orientation I entrepreneurship orientation scores	[32]	entrepreneurship orientation		entrepreneurship orientation scores

## Table 1: A detailed summary of other studies

# 3 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

In this study, a scale developed by Breazeale *et al.* [11] was used. The scale measures local entrepreneurial culture based on the perceptions of residents. Factor analysis was used to identify

the underlying attributes of local entrepreneurial culture. The four major factors determined were: 'diversity and change', 'business promotion', 'business discouragement', and a community-wide 'focus on local'. The validity of the scale was tested by associating the questionnaire results with the local rates of self-employment, controlling for important individual-level factors, and whether 'local' is rural or urban. The analysis results showed that the scale can measure entrepreneurial activity and can be a tool for evaluating entrepreneurial culture in other contexts.

Probability theory is associated with well-defined events and not with facts. It predicts the chance of whether or not those events will occur. On the other hand, fuzzy set theory tries to capture the essential concept of vagueness and defines the degree to which an event belongs to a set. In other words, probability theory deals with the *frequency* of occurrence in crisp events, whereas fuzzy set theory is associated with the *degree* of occurrence in crisp events ([33]).

In this study, the theory of fuzzy sets that captures the meaning of partial truth was used, instead of the probability theory that captures partial knowledge. In current studies using the Likert rating scale, probability theory is used, based on the frequency of different answers given to a statement (event); and the evaluation is also based on this approach. This study uses fuzzy set theory, based on the truth value obtained from the frequency of different answers given to a statement. Thus the methodology used is based on the value of the truth (possibility) of a statement.

Data was collected by using a questionnaire developed by Breazeale *et al.* [11], to measure local entrepreneurial culture. The entrepreneurial culture measurement questionnaire (ECMQ) consisted of 36 items. The questions were arranged as a five-point Likert-type scale, where 1 = strongly disagree and 5 = strongly agree. The original questionnaire was professionally translated into the Kyrgyz language by a bilingual person. The questionnaire forms were subjected to a sample of respondents in a pilot study. Omissions and questions that could cause misunderstanding were corrected. The corrected survey was then implemented among 400 respondents in Bishkek, the capital of Kyrgyzstan. The surveys were conducted using the face-to-face questionnaire method between July and September 2016. After the data was collected, it was appropriately encoded and analysed.

A reliability analysis was conducted for the factors that were used. Cronbach's alpha is one of the most widely used reliability statistics [34]. It measures the internal consistency of multi-point formatted questionnaires or scales (i.e., rating scale: 1 = strongly disagree, 5 = strongly agree). The alpha coefficient ranges in value from 0 to 1. The higher the score, the more reliable the generated scale is. George and Mallery provided the following rules of thumb: \_ > .9 - Excellent, \_ > .8 - Good, \_ > .7 - Acceptable, \_ > .6 - Questionable, \_ > .5 - Poor, and \_ < .5 - Unacceptable [35]. In this study, diversity and change, business promotion, business discouragement, and focus on local factors were rated on Cronbach's alpha as 0.722 (acceptable), 0.567 (poor), 0.552 (poor), and 0.663 (questionable) respectively. Cronbach's alpha was 0.863 for all 36 items and indicated good internal consistency for the 36 items in the scale.

# 4 THE MODEL TO EVALUATE LOCAL ENTREPRENEURIAL CULTURE

A two-level model was used to construct a quantitative measure of the local entrepreneurial culture. At the basic level, based on data collected by conducting the survey with entrepreneurs and nonentrepreneurs in Bishkek, a fuzzy artificial decision was obtained to use as the input for the top level. At the top level, a fuzzy multicriteria decision was used to determine the local entrepreneurial culture.

## 4.1 Basic level

The factors of diversity and change, focus on local, business promotion, and business discouragement shown in Figure 3 were used as the basic factors for a fuzzy artificial decision. The factors and their sub-components are:

$$\begin{split} F_i &= \{f_i^{n_i}\}, \ i = 1, 2, ..., I. \qquad I = 4 \ (\text{factor numbers}), \\ n_i &= 1, 2, ..., N_i, \ N_1 = 10, N_2 = 7, N_3 = 10, N_4 = 9 \ (\text{\# of sub-components}). \end{split} \tag{Equation 1}$$

The rating scale set to evaluate the entrepreneurial community culture, based on resident perceptions, is:

$$P = \{p_l\}, l = 1, 2, ..., L.$$
 (Equation 2)

Residents have five different view options (L=5) about their county, and how supportive it is of local entrepreneurship.

Let U be the space of local entrepreneurial culture,

$$U = \{u_m\}, m = 1.$$
 (Equation 3)

A singular factor evaluation for  $u_m$ ,  $\tilde{f}: F_i \to P$ , from  $F_i$  to P, is a fuzzy mapping, and fuzzy mapping  $\tilde{f}$ ,

$$T_{im} \in M_{N_i \times L}$$
 (Equation 4)

is a fuzzy relation, and is represented by a fuzzy matrix. It is normalised original data of the singular factor evaluation for  $u_m$  and transformed to  $T_{im}$  matrix.

The weights associated with the factor sub-component,

$$W_i \in M_{1 \ge N_i}$$
 (Equation 5)

are a fuzzy subset in  $F_i$ , and are represented by a fuzzy vector. The fuzzy AHP extended by Göleç and Taşkın was used to determine the weights associated with the factor sub-component [36].

Let  $T_{im}$  be input,  $T: F_i \rightarrow P$ , from  $F_i$  to P, is computed with a fuzzy transformation.

So the artificial decision statement is defined as:

$$B_{im} = W_i^{\circ} T_{im}$$
 (Equation 6)

where  $B_{im}$  is a fuzzy relation; and then the following operation is applied for the membership values:

$$\mu_{W_i^{\circ}T_{im}}(p) \triangleq \sum_{f_i \in F_i} \mu_{W_i}(f_i) \cdot \mu_{T_{im}}(f_i, p)$$
 (Equation 7)

where  $\mu_{W_i}(f_i)$ ,  $\mu_{T_{im}}(f_i, p)$ , and  $\mu_{W_i^\circ T_{im}}(p)$  are the membership functions of  $W_i, T_{im}$ , and  $W_i^\circ T_{im}$  respectively.  $B_{im}$  is a fuzzy subset and a fuzzy vector in P and can also be represented by  $B_{im} \in M_{1xL}$ .

The rating scale weights of how strongly the respondents agree or disagree with the statements about the county are represented by  $W_c \in M_{1xL}$ . For the rating scale weights, rank weights are obtained by the following equation:

$$w_j = \frac{r_j}{\sum_{k=1}^n (n - r_k + 1)}$$
 (Equation 8)

*n* rating scales were ranked from strongly disagree to strongly agree, and each scale was weighted with  $r_j$  where  $r_j$  is the rank position of the scale. Each weight was normalised by  $\sum_{k=1}^{n} (n - r_k + 1)$  [37].

A fuzzy transformation for  $r_{im}$  can be written as

$$r_{im} = B_{im} \circ W_c^T$$
 (Equation 9)

where

$$\mu_{B_{im}^{\circ}W_c^T}(F_i) \triangleq \sum_{p \in P} \mu_{B_{im}}(p) \cdot \mu_{W_c^T}(p, F_i)$$
 (Equation 10)

 $r_{im}$  can be shown in Figure 1. The  $r_{im}$  values of the artificial decision were used as the input for the top level.



## Figure 1: Illustration of $r_{im}$

### 4.2 Top level

The factor sets of the top level are based on the basic level and a multicriteria decision set, which consists of the following:

Let F be the factor sets:

$$F = \{F_i\}.$$
 (Equation 11)

Decision criteria set C consists of J decision criteria based on the factors below.

$$C = \{c_j\}, \quad j = 1, 2, ..., J, \quad J = 5.$$
 (Equation 12)

The following decision criteria can be created to calculate a quantitative measure of local entrepreneurial culture.

- $c_1$ : If the residents are more optimistic about the local culture's openness to diversity and change, it seems that local entrepreneurship rates are *good* in counties.
- $c_2$ : If the residents are more optimistic about the local culture's openness to diversity and change, and the business promotion climate is sustainable, it seems that local entrepreneurship rates are *very good* in counties.
- $c_3$ : If the residents are more optimistic about the local culture's openness to diversity and change, the business promotion climate is sustainable, and there is a community-wide focus on local, it seems that local entrepreneurship rates are *excellent* in counties.
- $c_4$ : If the residents are more optimistic about the local culture's openness to diversity and change, the business promotion climate is sustainable, there is a community-wide focus on local, and there is no climate of business discouragement, it seems that local entrepreneurship rates are *exceptional* in counties.
- $c_5$ : If the residents are more pessimistic about the local culture's openness to diversity and change, and the business promotion climate is not sustainable, it seems that local entrepreneurship rates are *poor* in counties.

The evaluation sets can be defined as follows:

$$A = \{A_k\}, \quad k = 1, 2, ..., K, \quad K = 5,$$
 (Equation 13)

and the evaluation functions A(v) can be defined as follows:

Where

$$v \in V, \quad V = \{v_l\} = \{0 \ 0.1 \ 0.2 \ 0.3 \ 0.4 \ 0.5 \ 0.6 \ 0.7 \ 0.8 \ 0.9 \ 1\}$$
 (Equation 15)  
 $l = 1, 2, ..., L, \quad L = 11.$ 

is the unit evaluation space (Figure 2).



Figure 2: The unit evaluation space, V.

The five criteria above can be stated as follows:

$c_1 = F_1,$	then	$A_1$
$c_2 = F_1 \cap F_2,$	then	$A_2$
$c_3 = F_1 \cap F_2 \cap F_3,$	then	$A_3$
$c_4 = F_1 \cap F_2 \cap F_3 \cap F_4,$	then	$A_4$
$c_5 = \overline{F_1}$ ,	then	$A_5$
	$\begin{array}{l} c_1 = F_1, \\ c_2 = F_1 \cap F_2, \\ c_3 = F_1 \cap F_2 \cap F_3, \\ c_4 = F_1 \cap F_2 \cap F_3 \cap F_4, \\ c_5 = \overline{F_1}, \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{ll} c_1=F_1, & \text{then} \\ c_2=F_1\cap F_2, & \text{then} \\ c_3=F_1\cap F_2\cap F_3, & \text{then} \\ c_4=F_1\cap F_2\cap F_3\cap F_4, & \text{then} \\ c_5=\overline{F_1}, & \text{then} \end{array}$

A single-factor evaluation for a quantitative measure of local entrepreneurial culture at the top level was a fuzzy mapping from F to U,  $\tilde{f}: F \to U$ , and a fuzzy matrix was represented by:

$$R = (R_{im}) \in M_{lxM}$$
 (Equation 16)

*R* can be used as the input for the top level. When processed according to the decision criteria, a fuzzy matrix can be obtained from a fuzzy mapping,  $\tilde{f}: C \to U$ , and a fuzzy inference of probability can be used as follows:

lf	$x = \tilde{c}_1$ ,	then	$y = A_1$
lf	$x = \tilde{c}_2$ ,	then	$y = A_2$
lf	$x = \tilde{c}_3$ ,	then	$y = A_3$
lf	$x = \tilde{c}_4,$	then	$y = A_4$
lf	$x = \tilde{c}_5,$	then	$y = A_5$

From the above inference system, the following matrix can be obtained:

$$D_j = \left(d_j(m, l)\right) \in M_{M \times L}$$
 (Equation 17)

where  $d_j(m, l) = 1 \land (1 - \tilde{c}_j(u_m) + A_k(v_l))$  is a fuzzy mapping from U to V,  $\tilde{f}: U \to V$ . Then, a fuzzy multicriteria decision matrix,

$$D = \bigcap_{j=1}^{J} D_{j} \triangleq \left(\prod_{j=1}^{J} d_{j}(m, l)\right) = \left(\tilde{E}_{m}\right) \in M_{1 \times L}$$
 (Equation 18)

is obtained. Thus, D is a fuzzy mapping from U to V,  $\tilde{f}: U \to V$ , and  $\tilde{E}_m$  is a fuzzy subset of unit evaluation space V representing the degrees of good for local entrepreneurial culture,  $u_1$ .

Let  $E_{m\alpha}$  be  $\alpha$ -cut sets,  $\alpha \in [0, 1] = I$ , of  $\tilde{E}_m$ .  $E_{m\alpha}$  sets are the ordered subsets of V. The average values of elements in  $E_{m\alpha}$  can be calculated by the following formula:

$$H_l(E_{m\alpha}) = \frac{1}{N_{\alpha}} \sum_{n=1}^{N_{\alpha}} Z_n(\alpha)$$
 (Equation 19)

where  $\alpha$  is the level of level-set and  $Z_n(\alpha)$ ,  $Z_n(\alpha) \in E_{m\alpha}$  are the elements in  $E_{m\alpha}$ .  $N_{\alpha}$  is the number of sequence of the finite sets of  $E_{m\alpha}$ . Then the point value of  $\tilde{E}_m$  can be calculated by the following formula [38]:

$$S(m) = \frac{1}{\alpha_{max}} \sum_{l=1}^{L} H_l(E_{m\alpha}) \,\Delta\alpha_l, \qquad (\text{Equation 20})$$

where  $\alpha_{max}$  is the maximum membership value of  $\tilde{E}_m$  and

$$\Delta \alpha_l = \alpha_l - \alpha_{l-1}, \, \alpha_1 = 0.$$
 (Equation 21)

S(m) is the value that measures the local entrepreneurial culture.

## 5 APPLICATION

Data was collected for a quantitative measurement methodology of local entrepreneurial culture based on the perceptions of entrepreneurs and non-entrepreneurs resident in Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan. The survey data is an entirely independent data set that estimated county-level rates of entrepreneurship, since one aim of the research was to use a scale that could be calculated for county-level entrepreneurship.

A total of 36 items, clustered as diversity and change, focus on local, business promotion, and business discouragement are adapted from measured attitude in this survey [11]. A framework to evaluate local entrepreneurial culture is constructed in Figure 3 [11].

The model constructed in Section 4 was applied, based on the framework in Figure 3. The factors in Level 2 of Figure 3 are the basic factors  $(F_i)$  for a fuzzy artificial decision. The indicators in Level 3 are the sub-components  $(f_i^{n_i})$  of the factors in Level 2, and measure 'attitude' in this survey. In Level 4, using the rating scale below, residents can tell how strongly they agree or disagree with each of the local entrepreneurship statements about the county:

 $P = \{1, 2, 3, 4, 5\} = \{\text{strongly disagree, disagree, neutral, agree, strongly agree}\}.$ 

The fuzzy relation matrices  $(T_{im})$  normalised the original data of the singular factor evaluation for  $u_m$ , and are given in Table 2.

The weights ( $W_i$ ) associated with the factor sub-component are given in Table 3. The artificial decision statement ( $B_{im}$ ) is given in Table 4.

	0.1071	0.1735	0.3010	0.2781	0.1403		0.1190	0.1190	0.2076	0.3215	0.232
	0.1159	0.2494	0.2997	0.2469	0.0882		0.1285	0.2368	0.3023	0.2519	0.080
	0.1554	0.2632	0.2732	0.2180	0.0902		0.1718	0.2667	0.3000	0.2077	0.053
	0.1954	0.3059	0.2751	0.1671	0.0566	Τ -	0 1190	0 1873	0 1722	0 3241	0 197
Τ -	0.1462	0.2282	0.2667	0.2590	0.1000	121-	0.1212	0.1075	0.1722	0.3241	0.055
111-	0.1247	0.2188	0.3053	0.2646	0.0865		0.1212	0.3030	0.3364	0.1010	0.055
	0.1148	0.2959	0.3061	0.2168	0.0663		0.1196	0.2977	0.3410	0.1985	0.043
	0.1371	0.2157	0.2766	0.2792	0.0914		0.1320	0.2741	0.3198	0.2208	0.053
	0.0863	0.2208	0.3299	0.2741	0.0888						
	0.1231	0.2789	0.2789	0.2337	0.0854						
Г	0.2839	0.1080	0.1960	0.2814	0.1307		0.1349	0.2366	0.3511	0.2188	0.0585
	0.1713	0.3149	0.2846	0.1940	0.0353		0.1367	0.1646	0.3089	0.3063	0.0835
	0.0964	0.2081	0.3299	0.2690	0.0964		0.1308	0.2333	0.2718	0.2821	0.0821
	0.1696	0.2962	0.2506	0.2177	0.0658		0.1291	0.2911	0.2633	0.2278	0.0886
-	0.1462	0.2436	0.2821	0.2462	0.0821	$T_{4,1} =$	0.1212	0.2197	0.3283	0.2273	0.1035
I <sub>31</sub> =	0.1574	0.2234	0.1827	0.3223	0.1142	41	0.1544	0.3114	0.2380	0.2051	0.0911
	0.1080	0.2412	0.3467	0.2286	0.0754		0.1575	0.3250	0.2200	0.2150	0.0825
	0.0787	0.1853	0.3959	0.2716	0.0685		0.1218	0.3401	0.2817	0,1929	0.0635
	0.0882	0.2191	0.3778	0.2343	0.0806		0.1641	0.2753	0.2803	0.2298	0.0505
	0.0856	0.1411	0.2872	0.2997	0.1864			0.2700	0.2000	0.2270	

Table 2: The fuzzy relation matrices  $(T_{im})$  used as input



Figure 3: The hierarchy to determine the local entrepreneurial culture

 $W_1 = \begin{bmatrix} 0.1314 & 0.1487 & 0.1268 & 0.1210 & 0.1119 & 0.0876 & 0.0712 & 0.0798 & 0.0697 & 0.0519 \end{bmatrix}$  $W_2 = \begin{bmatrix} 0.2565 & 0.1152 & 0.1867 & 0.1179 & 0.1247 & 0.1080 & 0.0909 \end{bmatrix}$  $W_3 = \begin{bmatrix} 0.1495 & 0.1437 & 0.0979 & 0.1246 & 0.1119 & 0.0661 & 0.0790 & 0.0811 & 0.0759 & 0.0703 \end{bmatrix}$  $W_4 = \begin{bmatrix} 0.1518 & 0.1472 & 0.1417 & 0.0847 & 0.1256 & 0.1103 & 0.0685 & 0.0725 & 0.0976 \end{bmatrix}$ 

Table 4: The artificial decision statement  $(B_{im})$ 

$B_{11} = \begin{bmatrix} 0.1356 & 0.2438 & 0.2915 & 0.2431 & 0.0926 \end{bmatrix}$	$B_{21} = \begin{bmatrix} 0.1314 & 0.2256 & 0.2727 & 0.2519 & 0.1175 \end{bmatrix}$
$B_{31} = \begin{bmatrix} 0.1530 & 0.2212 & 0.2861 & 0.2507 & 0.0913 \end{bmatrix}$	$B_{41} = \begin{bmatrix} 0.1367 & 0.2535 & 0.2897 & 0.2415 & 0.0770 \end{bmatrix}$

The rating scale weights  $(W_c)$  of the statements about the county are:

 $W_c = \begin{bmatrix} 0.0667 & 0.1333 & 0.2000 & 0.2667 & 0.3333 \end{bmatrix}$ 

The  $R = r_{im}$  matrix of the artificial decision is:

 $r_{im} = [0.1955 \quad 0.1997 \quad 0.1942 \quad 0.1909]^T.$ 

The CR matrix obtained according to the decision criteria is:

 $CR = [0.1955 \quad 0.1955 \quad 0.1942 \quad 0.1909 \quad 0.8045]^T.$ 

The  $D_i$  matrix obtained from the inference system is:

	0.8045	0.9045	1.0000	1.0000	1.0000	1.0000	1.0000	1.0000	1.0000	1.0000	1.0000
D <sub>j</sub> =	0.8045	0.8361	0.8939	0.9688	1.0000	1.0000	1.0000	1.0000	1.0000	1.0000	1.0000
	0.8058	0.8158	0.8458	0.8958	0.9658	1.0000	1.0000	1.0000	1.0000	1.0000	1.0000
	0.8091	0.8091	0.8091	0.8091	0.8091	0.8091	0.8091	0.8091	0.8091	0.8091	1.0000
	1.0000	1.0000	0.9955	0.8955	0.7955	0.6955	0.5955	0.4955	0.3955	0.2955	0.1955

The fuzzy multicriteria decision matrix (D) is:

 $D = \tilde{E}_1 = \Big[\frac{0.4219}{0} + \frac{0.4991}{0.1} + \frac{0.6089}{0.2} + \frac{0.6288}{0.3} + \frac{0.6216}{0.4} + \frac{0.5627}{0.5} + \frac{0.4818}{0.6} + \frac{0.4009}{0.7} + \frac{0.3200}{0.8} + \frac{0.2391}{0.9} + \frac{0.1955}{1}\Big].$ 

The membership function of D matrix for  $u_1$  is shown in Figure 4.

According to  $H_l(E_{m\alpha}) = \frac{1}{N_{\alpha}} \sum_{n=1}^{N_{\alpha}} Z_n(\alpha)$ ;  $E_{1\alpha}$ ,  $H_l(E_{1\alpha})$ , and  $\Delta \alpha$  values are calculated in Table 5. Then the point value of  $\tilde{E}_1$  can be calculated as follows:

$$\begin{split} S(1) &= \frac{1}{\alpha_{max}} \sum_{l=1}^{11} H_l(E_{1\alpha}) \,\Delta\alpha_l \\ &= \frac{1}{0.6288} \Big( 0.50(0.1955) + 0.45(0.0436) + 0.40(0.0809) + 0.35(0.0809) + 0.30(0.0210) \\ &\quad + 0.35(0.0599) + 0.30(0.0173) + 0.35(0.0636) + 0.30(0.0462) + 0.35(0.0127) \\ &\quad + 0.30(0.0072) \Big) \\ &= \frac{1}{0.6288} (0.2532) = 0.4027 \end{split}$$



Figure 4: The membership function of local entrepreneurial culture,  $u_1$ . Table 5: The  $\alpha$ -level sets of local entrepreneurial culture,  $u_1$ .

Ţ		<u>a</u> range								$E_{1a}$	τ						$H_l(E_{1\alpha})$	Δα
1	0.0000	$< \alpha \le$	0.1955	{	0	0.1	0.2	0.3	0.4	0.5	0.6	0.7	0.8	0.9	1	}	0.50	0.1955
2	0.1955	$< \alpha \le$	0.2391	{	0	0.1	0.2	0.3	0.4	0.5	0.6	0.7	0.8	0.9	}		0.45	0.0436
3	0.2391	$< \alpha \le$	0.3200	{	0	0.1	0.2	0.3	0.4	0.5	0.6	0.7	0.8	}			0.40	0.0809
4	0.3200	$< \alpha \le$	0.4009	{	0	0.1	0.2	0.3	0.4	0.5	0.6	0.7	}				0.35	0.0809
5	0.4009	$< \alpha \le$	0.4219	{	0	0.1	0.2	0.3	0.4	0.5	0.6	}					0.30	0.0210
6	0.4219	$< \alpha \le$	0.4818	{	0.1	0.2	0.3	0.4	0.5	0.6	}						0.35	0.0599
7	0.4818	$< \alpha \le$	0.4991	{	0.1	0.2	0.3	0.4	0.5	}							0.30	0.0173
8	0.4991	$< \alpha \le$	0.5627	{	0.2	0.3	0.4	0.5	}								0.35	0.0636
9	0.5627	$< \alpha \le$	0.6089	{	0.2	0.3	0.4	}									0.30	0.0462
10	0.6089	$< \alpha \le$	0.6216	{	0.3	0.4	}										0.35	0.0127
11	0.6216	$< \alpha \le$	0.6288	{	0.3	}											0.30	0.0072

Thus, the value that measures the local entrepreneurship culture  $(u_1)$  is obtained as 0.4027. The local entrepreneurship culture of the entrepreneurs under consideration was under the middle level. This result supports the findings of international reports on entrepreneurship. According to the research/s carried out by the World Bank and the Global Entrepreneurship Development Institute, Kyrgyzstan ranked below the middle level. On the other hand, this index (0.4027) only represents Bishkek, the capital of Kyrgyzstan, and may be the highest level in the country, as Bishkek is the main centre of attraction for businesses, investments, and human resources.

## 6 CONCLUSION, AND FURTHER WORK

Entrepreneurship is an important phenomenon in both developed and developing countries. Kyrgyzstan is a post-Soviet country located in Central Asia that declared its independence in 1991. Since gaining its independence, Kyrgyzstan has implemented reforms in order to develop a market economy. While Kyrgyzstan's economic transition and macroeconomic condition have been widely investigated, very little has been written about the country's development of entrepreneurship.

Recent literature has emphasised the significant relationship between culture and entrepreneurship. Lee *et al.* emphasised the role of national culture in stimulating entrepreneurial orientation [4]. Lalonde analysed the impact of culture on the process of starting a new venture and identified significant impacts [20]. Entrepreneurship culture is linked with the values shared by entrepreneurs,

such as risk-taking, innovativeness, and pro-activeness. A planned economic system, in which social and economic life are completely regulated by the state, limits the ability of people to take risks and, therefore, their spirit of creativity. The evaluation of entrepreneurial culture is crucial for productive entrepreneurship and sustained private sector development. The empirical result of this paper identifies the position in Kyrgyzstan.

In this study, a fuzzy model was constructed and implemented to measure local entrepreneurial culture. This approach is a suitable way to accommodate the imprecise and qualitative factors inherent in attempting to measure local entrepreneurial culture in a community in a specific location. Besides contributing to the assessment of local entrepreneurial culture in the community development literature, this model can also be used to focus on general cultural attributes, rather than on the perception that residents hold about the entrepreneurial climate. This paper provides a framework for policy makers to assess entrepreneurial culture for community development, and thereby contributes to future entrepreneurship research. It also identifies key decision areas or practices for entrepreneurship, and assesses the role of local cultural characteristics in entrepreneurship. From this study, Local managers can deduce that a low cultural environment appears to be a significant barrier to doing business. These programmes that work to develop entrepreneurs must focus on assessing and trying to improve the local entrepreneurial culture.

The local entrepreneurship culture in Bishkek was estimated as 0.4027, which is below the middle level. This result supports the findings of international reports on entrepreneurship carried out by the World Bank and the Global Entrepreneurship Development Institute, where Kyrgyzstan ranked below the middle level. To conclude, the results of this study should be very helpful in suggesting potential avenues for policy-makers and for government officials to improve entrepreneurship in their countries. To promote entrepreneurship development, the government should engage in redirecting and integrating the emerging entrepreneurship into legal and productive sectors of the economy.

However, the paper has several limitations. First, the research was conducted in the capital city of the country. Bishkek is not only the administrative capital, but also the business and trade centre of the country. Representativeness may thus be a concern. In the future, additional studies may need to be conducted in other parts of the country. Furthermore, a non-probability sampling method was used, which would further reduce the representativeness of the sample.

In future studies, the paper can be used as a scale to test the conceptual model presented above, and also to test the measure for reliability and validate it for specialised cultures. Entrepreneurial cultures may, or may not, be stable over time. So, it can test whether these correlate with entrepreneurial activities by obtaining local panel data from the developed model for every year. Furthermore, a forecasting model can be constructed for estimating local entrepreneurial culture. This model can be useful for the long-term stability of underlying local cultural differences.

## REFERENCES

- [1] Beugelsdijk, S. 2007. Entrepreneurial culture, regional innovativeness and economic growth. *Journal of Evolutionary Economics*, 17, pp. 187-210.
- [2] **Osoba, B.J.** 2009. Culture and entrepreneurial activity in the United States: A quantitative analysis. Innovation: The European Journal of Social Science Research, 22(3), pp. 341-370.
- [3] Lasch, F., Dana, L.P. & Mueller, J. 2009. Diversity in Central Asia: Culture, transition & entrepreneurship. Journal of Asia Entrepreneurship and Sustainability, 5(1), pp. 44-56.
- [4] Lee, S.M., Lim, S. & Pathak, R.D. 2011. Culture and entrepreneurial orientation: A multi-country study. International Entrepreneurship Management Journal, 7(1), pp. 1-15.
- [5] Marti, I., Courpasson, D. & Barbosa, S.D. 2013. 'Living in the fishbowl': Generating an entrepreneurial culture in a local community in Argentina. *Journal of Business Venturing*, 28(1), pp. 10-29.
- [6] Huggins, R. & Thompson, P. 2014. Culture, entrepreneurship and uneven development: A spatial analysis. Entrepreneurship & Regional Development, 26(9-10), pp. 726-752.
- [7] Chasovschi, C., Bordeianu, O. & Clipa, D. 2014. Entrepreneurial culture in transition economies: The case of Romania and Republic of Moldova. *Procedia Economics and Finance*, 15, pp. 1507-1514.
- [8] Brownson, Ch.D. 2015. Entrepreneurship awareness and entrepreneurial culture in Nigeria. Entrepreneurship and Innovation Management Journal, 3(3), pp. 118-128. National Statistical Committee of the Kyrgyz Republic. [accessed 15 January 2017] http://stat.kg/media/publicationarchive/319b4776-7250-4fbf-be72-3f6c2482a823.pdf,
- [9] The World Bank. Doing Business. http://www.doingbusiness.org/reports/global-reports/doing-business-2016, accessed 18.01.2017.

- [10] Breazeale, N., Fortunato, M.W.-P., Allen, J.E., Hustedde, R.J. & Pushkarskaya, H. 2015. Constructing a multi-dimensional measure of local entrepreneurial culture. *Community Development*, 46(5), pp. 516-540.
- [11] Dimitratos, P., Voudouris, I., Plakoyiannaki, E. & Nakos, G. 2012. International entrepreneurial culture: Toward a comprehensive opportunity-based operationalization of international entrepreneurship. International Business Review, 21, pp. 708-721.
- [12] Seaman, C., Bent, R. & Unis, A. 2015. Family entrepreneurship culture, entrepreneurial intent, futures and foresight in Scottish Pakistani Communities. *Futures*, 75, pp. 83-91.
- [13] GEM: Global Entrepreneurship Monitor Consortium. 2016/17 Global report.
- http://www.gemconsortium.org/report, accessed 15.01.2017.
- [14] **GEINDEX:** The Global Entrepreneurship and Development Institute. 2017 Global Entrepreneurship Index. https://thegedi.org/2017-global-entrepreneurship-index/, accessed 15.01.2017.
- [15] WBGES: The World Bank, World Bank Group Entrepreneurship Survey.
- http://www.doingbusiness.org/data/exploretopics/entrepreneurship, accessed 15.01.2017
- [16] Marcotte, C. 2013. Measuring entrepreneurship at the country level: A review and research agenda. Entrepreneurship & Regional Development, 25(3-4), pp. 174-194.
- [17] Mogollón, R.H. & Rubio, P.P. 2010. An approach to entrepreneurial culture and education in secondary school. *International Journal of Business Environment*, 3(1), pp. 120-134.
- [18] Mansor, M. & Othman, N. 2011. CoBLAS: Inculcating entrepreneurial culture among higher education institutions' students. International Journal of Social Science and Humanity, 1(1), pp. 86-91.
- [19] Lalonde, J.F. 2013. Cultural determinants of Arab entrepreneurship: An ethnographic perspective. Journal of Enterprising Communities: People and Places in the Global Economy, 7(3), pp. 213-232.
- [20] Choo, S. 2005. Developing an entrepreneurial culture in Singapore: Dream or reality. Asian Affairs, 36(3), pp. 361-373.
- [21] Haris, N.A. & Rahman, F.A. 2017. A study on application of fuzzy methods in entrepreneurship domain. International Journal of Advanced and Applied Sciences, 4(12), pp. 206-211.
- [22] Mavi, R.K. 2014. Indicators of entrepreneurial university: Fuzzy AHP and fuzzy TOPSIS approach. Journal of the Knowledge Economy, 5(2), pp. 370-387.
- [23] Han, J.-Y., Yang, Y.-B. & Zhao, Y.-H. 2012. Evaluation of entrepreneurial environment based on fuzzy comprehensive evaluation method. In: 2012 International Conference on Machine Learning and Cybernetics, ICMLC, 1, pp. 305-309.
- [24] Dehkordi, A.M., Sasani A., Fathi M.R. & Khanmohammadi, E. 2012. Investigating the effect of emotional intelligence and personality traits on entrepreneurial intention using the fuzzy DEMATEL method. *International Journal of Business and Social Science*, 3(13), pp. 286-296.
- [25] Arafeh, L. 2016. An entrepreneurial key competencies' model. *Journal of Innovation and Entrepreneurship*, 5, pp. 1-26.
- [26] Khefacha, I. & Belkacem, L. 2015. Modeling entrepreneurial decision-making process using concepts from fuzzy set theory. *Journal of Global Entrepreneurship Research*, 5(1), pp. 13-34.
- [27] Sheela, P. & Murthy, M. 2015. The use of fuzzy analytical hierarchy process (FAHP) model for the primary screening of business opportunity in the process of entrepreneurial activity. *International Journal of Marketing, Financial Services and Management Research*, 4(5), pp. 1-14.
- [28] Ferreira, P. & Dionisio, A. 2016. Entrepreneurship rates: The fuzzy-set approach. Eastern European Business and Economics Journal, 2(2), pp. 111-128.
- [29] Alroaia, Y.V., Hemati, M. & Javadinia, M. 2012. A new approach to develop entrepreneurship of the industry using fuzzy DEMATEL. *Management Science Letters*, 2(4), pp. 1279-1288.
- [30] Munoz, P. & Kibler, E. 2016. Institutional complexity and social entrepreneurship: A fuzzy-set approach. Journal of Business Research, 69(4), pp. 1314-1318.
- [31] **Rezaei, J., Ortt, R. & Scholten, V.** 2013. An improved fuzzy preference programming to evaluate entrepreneurship orientation. *Applied Soft Computing*, 13(5), pp. 2749-2758.
- [32] Ross, T.J. 2010. Fuzzy logic with engineering applications. New York: McGraw-Hill.
- [33] **Cronbach, L.J.** 1951. Coefficient alpha and the internal structure of tests. *Psychometrika*, 16, pp. 297-334.
- [34] George, D. & Mallery, P. 2003. SPSS for Windows step by step: A simple guide and reference. 11.0 update (4<sup>th</sup> ed.). Boston: Allyn & Bacon.
- [35] Göleç, A. & Taşkın, H. 2007. Novel methodologies and a comparative study for manufacturing systems performance evaluations. *Information Sciences*, 177(23), pp. 5253-5274.
- [36] Stillwell, W.G., Seaver, D.A. & Edwards, W. 1981. A comparison of weight approximation techniques in multiattribute utility decision making. Organizational Behavior and Human Performance, 28(1), pp. 62-77.
- [37] Yager, R.R. 1982. Multicriteria decisions with soft information: An application of fuzzy set and possibility theory. *Fuzzy Mathematics*, 2(2), pp. 21-28.